

Queensland Government response to the Economic Development Committee Report No. 4, October 2010 - Inquiry into the road safety benefits of fixed speed cameras

Part 1 – Commitment to Road Safety

Part 2 – Summary of Response to Recommendations

Part 3 – Detailed Response to Recommendations

Appendix A – History of Queensland's Road Toll

Part 1

Commitment to Road Safety

The Queensland Government is committed to reducing speed related crashes across the state and improving road safety outcomes for all road users.

In 2010, Queensland's road toll was 249 fatalities or 5.51 deaths per 100,000 population, which is 82 fatalities (or 24.8%) fewer than the previous year and 88 fatalities (or 26.1%) fewer than the previous five year average. The fatality rate of 5.51 deaths per 100,000 population recorded in 2010 is the lowest fatality rate for a calendar year in Queensland since accurate records began in 1952.

One in four road deaths in 2010 were speed related.

Queensland has seen specific reductions in a number of areas including:

- **Drink driving** – Between August 2009 and August 2010, fatalities from crashes involving drivers and riders with illegal blood/breath alcohol concentration declined by 31 fatalities or 40.3% which is 46.8% less than the 5 year average.
- **Speeding** - Between September 2009 and September 2010, fatalities from crashes involving speeding drivers and riders declined by 33 fatalities or 38.8% which is 38.4% less than the 5 year average.
- **Motorcycles** - Between September 2009 and September 2010 fatalities from crashes involving motorcycles declined by 26 fatalities or 38.2% which is 39.1% less than the 5 year average.
- **Young drivers and riders aged 17 to 24 years** - Between September 2009 and September 2010, fatalities from crashes involving young drivers and riders declined by 25 fatalities or 28.1% which is 39.6% less than the 5 year average.

Some of the Queensland Government's initiatives that may have contributed to the 2010 lower road toll include:

- expansion of the speed camera program including covert mobile speed camera operations and fixed speed cameras.
- increase in traffic police to deter risky driver behaviour by enforcing random roadside drug and alcohol testing, and operate speed cameras.
- changes to the motorcycle and graduated licensing system to improve the safety of young drivers and motorcyclists by requiring 100 hours of log book recorded supervised driving experience; a two phased provisional licence; restrictions for passengers, high-powered vehicles and mobile phone use; and being required to hold a driver's licence for a year before being eligible for a motorcycle licence.
- allocation of \$66 million from the Safer Roads Sooner Program to improve roads and roadsides at high crash locations.
- implementation of the Queensland Motorcycle Safety Strategy 2009-2012 included power-to-weight ratio and upper engine capacity restrictions on RE licence holders, a prohibition of learner riders carrying pillion passengers, and compulsory display of P plates.
- stronger fatigue and speed compliance legislation for the heavy vehicle industry.

New alcohol ignition interlock laws came into effect on 6 August 2010. Alcohol ignition interlocks apply to people who are convicted of high-risk drink driving offences.

In addition, three major drink driving reforms will take effect from mid 2011, including:

- police will be able to immediately suspend drivers with a Blood Alcohol Limit (BAC) of 0.10, down from the current limit of 0.15;
- an arresting or detaining officer will be able to perform an evidentiary breath analysis themselves, without the presence of a second officer as is currently required; and
- the time limit for officers to get an evidentiary secondary blood or breath test will be extended from two to three hours.

Since 2007, a range of initiatives were implemented by the Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service to reduce the incidence of road congestion and improve road safety including:

- a congestion management strategy titled 'Free-Flow' which involves police motorcycle patrols on major arterial roads in South East Queensland (SEQ) during peak travel times;
- the deployment of police officers to the Brisbane Metropolitan Transport Management Centre (BMTMC) during peak travel times;
- funding for a further 106 dedicated specialist traffic officers plus:
 - 30 additional hand-held laser speed detection devices
 - 16 mobile radar speed detection devices and 12 micro-digicam speed detectors that provide police with strategic speed management capabilities
 - 8 additional Q-Cars - doubling the number of Q-Cars patrolling Queensland roads
 - 12 additional police motorcycles for traffic enforcement and to assist with Operation Freeflow on roads such as the Gateway Motorway
- statewide roll-out of new vehicle impoundment laws targeting recidivist drink drivers, disqualified and unlicensed drivers and those driving unregistered or illegally modified vehicles;
- commencement of graduated licensing for learner and provisional license holders aimed at reducing the incidence of road trauma involving young and novice drivers; and
- the introduction of a roadside drug driving testing regime.

The impact of these changes is evidenced by more motorists are slowing down and complying with the posted speed limits. Between November 2009 and May 2010, the results of the bi-annual State-Wide Speed Survey evidenced a 0.5km/h reduction in mean speeds across the state. Although the speed reductions appear to be small, the observed mean speed reduction could be expected to reduce the number of people injured by up to 4% and reduce the number of people fatally injured by up to 7% depending on the road type.

The Government's response to the Queensland Parliamentary Economic Development Committee's inquiry into the road safety benefits of fixed speed cameras presents key recommendations to support the fixed speed camera program and overall speed management strategy in Queensland. The Government agrees with the Committee that speed cameras play an important role in improving road safety in Queensland.

While the Government supports the Committee's recommendations into the overall management of speed cameras and red light cameras in Queensland, any changes to the fixed speed camera program and overall speed management strategy should be based on best practice and evidence based policy.

It is for this reason the mobile speed camera program is evaluated on a regular basis and results are published in the Department of Transport and Main Roads Annual Report. The first fixed speed cameras were only installed in December 2007 and will be evaluated when adequate crash data is available to credibly analyse their effect. The first results are expected in mid 2011.

The Committee highlighted in its report that there is limited knowledge in the community regarding the legislative requirements on the use of revenue from camera detected offences for specific road safety purposes such as road safety education, infrastructure and rehabilitation programs once the administration and operating costs of the program have been recouped. The Government will work harder to communicate this with the public to increase the credibility and accountability of this effective road safety initiative. This will include highlighting on infringement notices how speed camera revenue is used.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads and Queensland Police Service will also continue to ensure speed camera and red light camera information contained on their websites remains current and comprehensive including the publication of evaluation results and the dangers of speeding.

The Queensland Government is committed to introducing proven speed management initiatives such as fixed speed cameras and covert mobile speed cameras as many motorists are still exceeding the posted speed limit and therefore increasing their risk of being involved in a crash and endangering the lives of other road users. The Queensland Government looks forward to continuing to work with the Committee towards reducing road trauma in Queensland.

Part 2

Summary Response to Economic Development Committee Report No 4 Inquiry into the road safety benefits of speed cameras

No	Recommendation	Government Response
1.	That the Queensland Government investigates the benefits of a reward program for speed compliant drivers.	Supported The Department of Transport and Main Roads will investigate the benefits of a reward program for speed compliant drivers, including options targeting young drivers under the age of 25. The investigation will include its road safety benefits, eligibility criteria, method of delivery, cost of operation and privacy implications.
2.	That the Queensland Government undertakes a comprehensive evaluation of the fixed speed camera program.	Supported The mobile speed camera program is independently evaluated on a regular basis and reported in the Department of Transport and Main Roads' annual report. A new evaluation framework for the Camera Detected Offence Program is being developed by the Monash University Accident Research Centre and due to be tested in 2011.
3.	That the Queensland Government, when selecting a fixed speed camera model for use in Queensland, considers the initial purchase cost, costs associated with altering the road environment to ensure the camera's optimal operation, recurring maintenance costs, ease of transmission of data to the Traffic Camera Office, reliability of the camera and the way that the camera data fits with the Queensland Government processing systems for offences.	Supported Site selection process is currently articulated in site selection guidelines which consider associated costs, environmental, technical and operational factors. Meta data created by the camera systems is managed and processed to align with manufacturer requirements, legislation, policy and judicial practices.
4.	That the Queensland Government creates and maintains a website that contains the location of each fixed speed camera, including combined red light and speed cameras, as well as the reasons for placing cameras at each of these locations, such as the crash history or potential to develop a crash history on each site. The website should also contain more general information regarding speeding.	Supported The Department of Transport and Main Roads is committed to ensuring motorists have access to the most up to date information about speeding and fixed speed cameras in Queensland. The department will update the dedicated speed and red light camera website to include the crash data used for selecting fixed camera sites, a photograph of the location, evaluation results (when available) and details about the allocation of fine revenue for specific road safety purposes.
5.	That the Queensland Government provides a link to the proposed fixed speed camera website on all speed camera infringement notices.	Supported A link to both the Department of Transport and Main Roads Camera Detected Offence Program website and the Queensland Police Service website is included on the current form.

6.	That the Queensland Government provides clearer information to local governments, the Local Government Association of Queensland and local road safety advisory committees on the criteria for selecting fixed speed camera sites and undertakes more consultation during the site selection process to ensure local knowledge, as well as evidence-based data, is used to inform decisions on site selection and promote greater public acceptance and understanding of fixed speed cameras.	<p>Supported</p> <p>Fixed speed camera sites are considered by the relevant regional Speed Management Advisory Committee that has representatives from Queensland Police Service, the Department of Transport and Main Roads, RACQ and Local Government.</p> <p>The Department of Transport and Main Roads will write to the Local Government Association Queensland to reiterate the process for selecting sites. The Queensland Police Service will ensure all Speed Management Advisory Committee members are aware of the process and their role in selecting fixed speed camera sites.</p>
7.	That the Queensland Government places fixed speed cameras on roads with speed limits of less than 60 km/hr, particularly outside schools and kindergartens that present with crash potential or crash history and where other speed enforcement measures are inappropriate.	<p>Supported</p> <p>Current policy already allows fixed speed cameras to be installed on roads with speed limits less than 60km/h. Fixed speed camera sites in Queensland are selected in order to maximise their road safety benefit, specifically to reduce motorists' speed and therefore reduce speed-related crashes.</p> <p>As noted in the whole-of-government submission, sites were selected using crash history and the locations with the highest number and severity of crashes were considered first. Increased road safety benefit can be achieved by placing the cameras on roads with a higher frequency of crashes. The initial fixed speed camera sites are on roads of at least 60km/h because these sites have been prioritised as the greatest need to date.</p>
8.	That the Queensland Police Service investigates whether the use of non-sworn officers in the mobile speed camera program would allow a greater number of policing hours to be used more effectively in other community safety activities.	<p>Supported</p> <p>The Queensland Government is investigating enforcement options for mobile camera operations including the use of non-sworn operators.</p>
9.	That the Queensland Government provides information to the public on a website on how data from the speed camera program is collected, for what purposes, for whom and for how long.	<p>Supported</p> <p>The Queensland Police Service has a number of systems and processes in place where the security of information and data is protected and has strict guidelines in respect to sharing this information in accordance with the <i>Public Records Act 2002</i> and <i>Information Privacy Act 2009</i>.</p> <p>Information will be available on the Queensland Police Service website in due course.</p>

10.	That the Queensland Government uses the revenue generated by the Camera Detected Offence Program, with the exception of the administration costs of the program, to fund one-off projects and that this revenue not be used as a source of recurrent funding.	<p>Not supported</p> <p>Excess revenue from the Camera Detected Offence Program is directed to the Safer Roads Sooner program and funds individual infrastructure projects targeting known high severity crash sites.</p> <p>Recurrent funding is provided to Queensland Health to support trauma/rehabilitation for road crashes and the costs to Queensland for blood and blood products. This funding may be affected if this recommendation is implemented.</p>
11.	That the Queensland Government amends the <i>Transport Operations (Road Use Management) Act 1995</i> to allow, in addition to the existing purposes for which camera detected revenue can be used, the use of camera detected revenue to improve the safety of local government-controlled roads and to conduct research for the purposes of improving road safety and road injury rehabilitation.	<p>Not supported</p> <p>Excess funding available from the Camera Detected Offence Program is limited and needs to be prioritised to ensure the maximum road safety benefits are achieved. Amendments to the <i>Transport Operations (Road Use Management) Act 1995</i> to allow use of excess revenue to be used for improvements to local government roads are not supported. State funding is currently provided to local governments through the Transport Infrastructure Development Scheme and the Roads Alliance, in addition to Commonwealth funding.</p> <p>Further, amendments to enable research funding are not supported as it provides uncertain returns and road safety benefits. There are other State and Federal Government research grants available.</p>
12.	The committee recommends that the Queensland Government sets aside a proportion of revenue from the Camera Detected Offence Program into a Road Safety Fund. The fund will be accessible to local councils in partnership with community groups or other non-government organisations, through the Queensland Government on a grant basis for programs that address local road safety issues and the evaluation of these programs.	<p>Not supported</p> <p>This recommendation is not supported as the limited amount of funds available from the Camera Detected Offence Program should be used mainly for the improvements in road infrastructure.</p> <p>There are currently other sources of funding for local community road safety partnerships such as the Safe School Travel Program, Community Road Safety Activity Fund, School Crossing Supervisor Scheme, and Transport Infrastructure Development Scheme.</p>
13.	The committee recommends that the Queensland Government ensures that the criteria used for selecting sites for combined red light and speed cameras meet the requirements for both red light and speed cameras, rather than one or the other.	<p>Not supported</p> <p>Whilst combined red light/speed cameras primarily target motorists disobeying traffic signals, speeding increases the risk of a crash and the severity of the crash outcome.</p> <p>Red light cameras are only installed at intersections that have the highest number of crashes from disobeying signals. Speeding at intersection crashes is likely to be under-reported because the primary cause of an intersection crash is either failing to give way or failing to stop at a red light (even though speed is a contributing factor in many intersection crashes). Because of this, any criteria that require speed crash data will possibly fail to identify many high crash intersection locations, due to possible under reporting.</p>

14.	The committee recommends that the Queensland Government undertakes a process and outcome evaluation of all new speed enforcement technologies that they trial.	<p>Supported</p> <p>Camera technologies being used (and trialled) in Queensland are proven technologies. Each of the current trial digital cameras is being evaluated for performance in line with the new processing system.</p> <p>The Queensland Police Service and the Department of Transport and Main Roads actively engage external research bodies for the purpose of review and evaluation of road safety initiatives and programs.</p> <p>The mobile speed camera program has been evaluated each year since its introduction.</p>
15.	The committee recommends that the Queensland Government tables in Queensland Parliament all evaluations recommended in this report within 12 months of the evaluation's completion date.	<p>Partially Supported</p> <p>This recommendation is partially supported. Rather than table evaluations separately to the Queensland Parliament, they will be included in the next available Department of Transport and Main Roads Annual Report that is tabled in Parliament. Findings are also published on the Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service websites.</p>

Part 3 – Detailed Response to Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION 1

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government investigates the benefits of a reward program for speed compliant drivers.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The Department of Transport and Main Roads will investigate the benefits of a reward program for speed compliant drivers including options targeting young drivers under the age of 25.

The investigation will take into account the type of reward, how it will be delivered and who will be eligible. For example, a reward program may be targeted at drivers who complete their first three years of driving without receiving a traffic infringement or for open licence holders who when renewing their licence have completed five years without a traffic infringement.

A rewards scheme may possibly include a discount on registration or licensing fees. Opportunities may also exist to partner with stakeholders, for example motor vehicle organisations or associations, to provide other types of discounts or benefits.

RECOMMENDATION 2

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government undertakes a comprehensive evaluation of the fixed speed camera program.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs and Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The Queensland mobile speed camera program has been independently evaluated on a regular basis since the program's inception with results being reported in the Department of Transport and Main Roads annual report.

As noted in the government submission to the inquiry a new evaluation framework for the Camera Detected Offence Program is being developed by the Monash University Accident Research Centre. The new framework will allow for the evaluation of mobile, fixed, combined red light/speed, and point-to-point speed camera systems. This research project is currently underway and it is expected that the framework will be tested, (using 2008 data when data is available), in early 2011.

As the first fixed speed cameras were only installed in December 2007, there has previously been limited crash data to credibly analyse the effect of fixed speed cameras in Queensland. The first results using the newly test framework are expected in 2011 from Monash University Accident Research Centre.

RECOMMENDATION 3

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government, when selecting a fixed speed camera model for use in Queensland, considers the initial purchase cost, costs associated with altering the road environment to ensure the camera's optimal operation, recurring maintenance costs, ease of transmission of data to the Traffic Camera Office, reliability of the camera and the way that the camera data fits with the Queensland Government processing systems for offences.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

Site selection process is currently articulated in site selection guidelines which consider associated costs, environmental, technical and operational factors.

The operational factors include Occupational Health and Safety principles for police and motorists. Environmental factors include distance from the source of power and communications. Technical factors include the limitations and constraints of the photographic speed detection devices operating within a suitable environment.

Meta data created by the camera systems is managed and processed to align with manufacturer requirements, legislation, policy and judicial practices.

The transmission of all camera data from the camera site to the Traffic Camera Office is secured through an encryption or secure network.

As outlined to the Committee, the Queensland Police Service is currently undertaking a proof of concept phase that is evaluating and assessing new digital camera technology. This evaluation includes the transmission of data and its fit for purpose.

During the site assessment, the Queensland Police Service considers the appropriate technology that provides the greatest road safety benefits at that site and ensures that the device is 'fit for purpose' to ensure legislative and operational integrity is maintained.

RECOMMENDATION 4

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government creates and maintains a website that contains the location of each fixed speed camera, including combined red light and speed cameras, as well as the reasons for placing cameras at each of these locations, such as the crash history or

potential to develop a crash history on each site. The website should also contain more general information regarding speeding.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The department is committed to ensuring motorists have access to the most up to date information about speeding and fixed speed cameras in Queensland. The department will update the dedicated speed and red light camera website to include the crash data used for selecting fixed camera sites, a photograph of the location, evaluation results (when available) and details about the allocation of fine revenue for specific road safety purposes.

Since the introduction of fixed speed cameras in Queensland, the Department of Transport and Main Roads has provided considerable information to motorists regarding the location of cameras. As fixed speed cameras are designed to slow down motorists in specific locations, sites have been publicised across Queensland via the website, in the local area where cameras are installed via advertising, and each site is clearly signed advising a fixed speed camera is ahead.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads website already lists fixed speed camera sites (including trial digital sites and sites that are not yet operational). All fixed speed camera sites have also been advertised in local media before becoming operational.

In addition, general information is provided on site selection, camera operations, revenue distribution, stopping distances and the dangers of speeding. Fact sheets regarding fixed speed cameras and digital technology are also available. Information is also provided on the Queensland Police Service website, including detailed information regarding infringement notices.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service will continue to ensure the information contained on their websites remains current and comprehensive.

Information regarding speed and red light cameras, including fixed speed camera locations, can be found at www.tmr.qld.gov.au/cameras.

RECOMMENDATION 5

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government provides a link to the proposed fixed speed camera website on all speed camera infringement notices.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The content of the infringement notice is the responsibility of the Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs as legislated in the *Transport Operations (Road Use Management) Act 1995*.

A link to both the Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service websites is included on the current form.

The infringement form is used for all camera detected offences, not only fixed speed cameras. As such, the more general www.tmr.qld.gov.au/cameras link has been provided on the infringement notice, since 21 October 2010. From this webpage motorists can find the list of current and trial fixed speed camera sites. Information on the dangers of speeding and other types of cameras is also included on this page.

The department will also update this link to include the crash data used for selecting fixed camera sites, a photograph of the location, evaluation results (when available) and details about the allocation of fine revenue for specific road safety purposes.

RECOMMENDATION 6

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government provides clearer information to local governments, the Local Government Association of Queensland and local road safety advisory committees on the criteria for selecting fixed speed camera sites and undertakes more consultation during the site selection process to ensure local knowledge, as well as evidence-based data, is used to inform decisions on site selection and promote greater public acceptance and understanding of fixed speed cameras.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs and Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The fixed speed camera program in Queensland has so far only included a limited number of cameras. Sites are selected centrally to ensure the most strategic placement of cameras across the road network and so new technology can be thoroughly tested and trialled.

Fixed speed camera sites in Queensland are selected in order to maximise their road safety benefit, specifically to reduce motorists' speed and therefore reduce speed-related crashes. As noted in the whole-of-government submission sites were selected using crash history and the locations with the highest number and severity of crashes were considered first. Both state and local roads are considered when selecting sites.

Upon identification of a candidate site for a fixed speed camera the Queensland Police Service, through their Regional Traffic Advisors, advise the members of the relevant regional Speed Management Advisory Committee (SMAC) of the proposed site and treatment. A SMAC generally comprises representatives from Queensland Police Service, the Department of Transport and Main Roads, RACQ and Local Government. Members are asked to provide the Queensland Police Service Traffic Camera Office and the Department of Transport and Main Roads with any relevant local knowledge regarding the site. Sites are approved (or not) only after consideration of detailed information about the proposed site and camera treatment.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads will write to the Local Government Association Queensland to reiterate the process for selecting sites. The Queensland Police Service will ensure all SMAC members are aware of the process and their role in selecting fixed speed camera sites.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads will request the Local Government Association Queensland to communicate with councils the importance of SMAC membership, and ensuring the most appropriate council representative is on each regional committee.

RECOMMENDATION 7

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government places fixed speed cameras on roads with speed limits of less than 60 km/hr, particularly outside schools and kindergartens that present with crash potential or crash history and where other speed enforcement measures are inappropriate.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

Current policy already allows fixed speed cameras to be installed on roads with speed limits less than 60km/h. Fixed speed camera sites in Queensland are selected in order to maximise their road safety benefit, specifically to reduce motorists' speed and therefore reduce speed-related crashes.

The Queensland Police Service has a phased approach to fixed camera systems in that Queensland Police Service apply non-camera enforcement initially (hand held speed detection devices and patrol based).

In the event non-camera enforcement does not achieve the change in behaviour expected and where the operational limitations prohibit this strategy, consideration is then given to deploying mobile cameras as a priority before considering installing a fixed speed camera system. The Queensland Police Service is currently identifying potential mobile speed camera sites on roads with speed limits less than 60km/h.

As noted in the whole-of-government submission, sites were selected using crash history and the locations with the highest number and severity of crashes were

considered first. Increased road safety benefit can be achieved by placing the cameras on roads with a higher frequency of crashes. The initial fixed speed camera sites are on roads of at least 60km/h because these sites have been prioritised as the greatest need to date.

The Queensland Police Service conduct both mobile speed camera and non-camera enforcement on local roads. In December 2010, mobile speed camera operations commenced on roads with a 40km/h and 50km/h speed limit. Sites on these roads are selected and deployed in line with current policy.

The Queensland Police Service is currently in the procurement process for the implementation of AGILE (hand held) camera systems to enhance on road enforcement, reinforcing the 'anywhere, anytime' philosophy. The AGILE project will provide the technology and the resources for the Queensland Police Service to effectively and efficiently deploy road safety cameras.

RECOMMENDATION 8

The committee recommends that the Queensland Police Service investigates whether the use of non-sworn officers in the mobile speed camera program would allow a greater number of policing hours to be used more effectively in other community safety activities.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The Queensland Government, through the Queensland Police Service and the Department of Transport and Main Roads are investigating enforcement options for mobile camera operations including the use of non-sworn operators. The Queensland Police Service has implemented non-sworn personnel (technical officers) into fixed speed and red light camera operations.

Camera operations are a critical component of the Speed Management Strategy and the Queensland Government frequently undertake continuous improvement activities to enhance all on road policing strategies.

RECOMMENDATION 9

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government provides information to the public on a website on how data from the speed camera program is collected, for what purposes, for whom and for how long.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs and Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The Queensland Police Service is responsible for the operation of speed cameras and the processing of infringements.

The Queensland Police Service has a number of systems and processes in place where the security of information and data is protected and has strict guidelines in respect to sharing this information.

The use of any camera technology that uses automatic number plate recognition (ANPR) software and storage of data is secured as required by legislation (*Public Records Act 2002* and *Information Privacy Act 2009*).

The Queensland Police Service will develop policy and guidelines to be published in the 'Statement of Affairs' on the police website. The Department of Transport and Main Roads will work with the Queensland Police Service to ensure this information is available on both departments' websites.

RECOMMENDATION 10

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government uses the revenue generated by the Camera Detected Offence Program, with the exception of the administration costs of the program, to fund one-off projects and that this revenue not be used as a source of recurrent funding.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is not supported.

Comment:

The Department of Transport and Main Roads strongly supports the continued use of Camera Detected Offence Program revenue for road safety initiatives that contribute to lowering Queensland's road toll.

Currently excess revenue from the Camera Detected Offence Program is directed to the Safer Roads Sooner program and funds individual infrastructure projects. Safer Roads Sooner aims to reduce the number and severity of crashes at locations using cost-effective, high-benefit treatments to address known high severity crash sites (with a history of crashes resulting in fatalities or serious injuries) and other high-risk locations on the state controlled network.

Recurrent funding is provided to Queensland Health to support trauma/rehabilitation for road crashes and the costs to Queensland for blood and blood products. This funding provides much needed support to trauma/rehabilitation services in Queensland and ensures Queensland Health meets its responsibilities under the National Blood Agreement to provide a safe, efficient, effective and ongoing blood management program to Queenslanders. In the 2009/10 financial year, \$4,500,000

of excess revenue was provided to Queensland Health. This funding may be affected if the recommendation is implemented.

Queensland Health contributes to the cost of the blood and blood products used in treating patients in both the public and private sectors in Queensland. The cost to Queensland Health for blood and blood products has more than doubled since 2004-05. In 2010-11, Queensland Health will spend an estimated \$80.8 million on blood and blood products with current growth in costs averaging 11% per annum.

The blood and blood products plays a vital role in the rehabilitation of road crash victims as there are clear linkages between road crashes and the use of blood products in hospitals for road crash victims.

Blood transfusions save the lives of thousands of injured patients each year including those injured in road crashes. Research published in 2005 by Hess and Hiippala entitled '*Optimising the use of blood products in trauma care*' found that around 10% of trauma care patients received blood, and that across the world, motor vehicle crashes are the most common cause of severe injury. The Australian Red Cross Blood Bank Services indicates that 2% of donated blood is used for trauma including road accidents.

In *A Trauma Plan for Queensland (2006)* (developed in conjunction Queensland Health) research studies undertaken concluded the following:

- Transport accidents account for 28% of trauma incidents in Queensland;
- Motor vehicle accidents consistently result in the most severe injuries;
- Injury is the fourth leading cause of death in Queensland after cancer, ischaemic heart disease and cerebrovascular disease;
- Queensland has the highest rate of injury of any of the states of Australia;
- In Queensland injury results in 10% of all hospital admissions;
- In Queensland hospitals, the two highest injuries that patients presented with were lower limb orthopaedic injuries (34.8%) and head and face injuries (30.1%);
- Road trauma in Queensland causes most significant injury resulting in 50% of hospital admissions for major trauma.

The amount of fines collected from speed cameras is minimal compared to the costs that speed-related crashes inflict on the community each year. Speed-related crashes place a high cost on the community each year through hospital and health care costs, lost productivity in the workplace and the use of emergency services. Every fatality that occurs on our roads creates an estimated social cost of \$2.6 million and every hospitalisation creates \$231 751 in social costs. It is for these reasons the continuation of the excess revenue to Queensland Health to support trauma/rehabilitation for road crashes and the costs to Queensland for blood and blood products is supported.

The use of excess revenue is currently being reviewed and the potential uses for funding may be expanded including the use of the funds for other recurrent funding related to road safety.

RECOMMENDATION 11

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government amends the Transport Operations (Road Use Management) Act 1995 to allow, in addition to the existing purposes for which camera detected revenue can be used, the use of camera detected revenue to improve the safety of local government-controlled roads and to conduct research for the purposes of improving road safety and road injury rehabilitation.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is not supported.

Comment:

Excess funding available from the Camera Detected Offence Program is limited and needs to be prioritised to ensure the maximum road safety benefits are achieved. As the Camera Detected Offence Program has been expanded and enhanced, detection rates have decreased from December 2009 to June 2010. This is a positive road safety result as this means driver behaviour has improved as motorists are complying with the posted speed limit at fixed and mobile speed camera sites across Queensland. This behaviour change has resulted in reduced funds available for road safety programs.

Amendments to the *Transport Operations (Road Use Management) Act 1995* to allow for the use of excess revenue to be used for improvements to local government roads are not supported.

Funding is currently provided to local governments through the Transport Infrastructure Development Scheme to improve the safety of local roads. The total expenditure administered to the local government through the Roads Alliance in 2009-10 was approximately \$89 million. The Roads Alliance is a partnership between the Department of Transport and Main Roads, and local government, represented by the Local Government Association of Queensland, to deliver better roads sooner across Queensland.

The Federal Government also provides road funding for local governments. These funds are untied and councils may spend the grants according to local priorities. Queensland councils were provided \$110,719,520 in funding for 2009/10 and \$119,929,073 for 2010/11. In addition, local governments may be eligible for further funding support via the Australian Government's Roads to Recovery Program and the Black Spot Program.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service continue to promote road safety on local government roads via the Camera Detected Offence Program, including mobile speed deployments. Local government roads will continue to be considered for fixed speed camera sites as locations are selected in order to maximise their road safety benefit across the entire road network whether that be local or state controlled roads.

Amendments are not supported to the *Transport Operations (Road Use Management) Act 1995* to allow for the use of funds to conduct research for the purposes of improving road safety and road injury rehabilitation. The main purpose of the excess Camera Detected Offence Program revenue is to target initiatives that have the most impact on reducing the road toll and to improve overall road safety in Queensland. As funding is limited, prevention of crashes must be the priority. This includes initiatives such as road infrastructure improvements and road safety public education.

Following the prevention of crashes, the next priority is funding for existing trauma and rehabilitation programs that have immediate road safety benefits for road crash casualties. Whilst there may be many worthy research projects requiring funding the investment in such research would provide uncertain returns and road safety benefits.

There are numerous State and Federal Government grants available to non-profit organisations and research bodies to undertake research into road injury rehabilitation. For example, the National Health and Medical Research Council support health and medical research and provides funding for all areas of research relevant to human health and medical research. This includes funding to support the infrastructure required to complete health and medical research in Australia.

In addition, the provisions of the Motor Accident Insurance Act 1994 gives the Motor Accident Insurance Commission a legislated role to promote measures directed at eliminating or reducing the causes of motor vehicle accidents and mitigating their results. To achieve this objective the Commission has made one-off as well as recurrent funding grants to universities, hospital foundations and medical colleges.

MAIC provided \$1.5m in 2009/10 to the Centre of National Research on Disability and Rehabilitation Medicine. As a nationally recognised research centre, it conducts research into the acute care and rehabilitation of people injured in motor vehicle accidents and related events and into the prevention and management of consequent disabilities.

The Queensland Government is also committed to supporting injury prevention, rehabilitation, education and awareness.

In 2010-11 the Department of Communities (Disability and Community Care Services) will provide recurrent funding of \$16,520,434 to Spinal Injuries Association. This includes \$9 million under the Spinal Cord Injuries Response program – which is a co-ordinated whole of government approach to support people with newly acquired spinal cord injuries transition back to community living in a timely manner, reducing the burden on the health care system and enhancing quality of life. Additional funding is provided through Adult Lifestyle Support, Disability Assistance Package, Emergency and Crisis, Family Support, Younger People in Residential Aged Care and HACC Programs.

The Department of Communities also contributes non-recurrent funding of \$40 000 per year for three years (2011-14) to the Spinal Education Awareness Team (SEAT) program – which is an early intervention and injury prevention program that reaches Queensland primary and secondary students. Its intent is to raise students awareness of high-risk behaviours and potential spinal cord injury before reaching

the highest risk age groups of late teens and early twenties. The Department of Transport and Main Roads is also providing an additional \$50,000 funding to the Spinal Injuries Association for this program for the next three years.

RECOMMENDATION 12

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government sets aside a proportion of revenue from the Camera Detected Offence Program into a Road Safety Fund. The fund will be accessible to local councils in partnership with community groups or other non-government organisations, through the Queensland Government on a grant basis for programs that address local road safety issues and the evaluation of these programs.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is not supported.

Comment:

This recommendation is not supported as the limited amount of funds available from the Camera Detected Offence Program should be used mainly for the improvements in road infrastructure. There are currently other sources of funding for local community road safety partnerships.

The development and management of such a Road Safety Fund will involve costs incurred by the Department of Transport and Main Roads and other agencies. As such an increase in administrative and operational costs from the Camera Detected Offence Program may be required. This in turn will reduce the funds available for road safety programs.

The Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service are committed to assisting local governments and the community to address local road safety issues. Funding and support for local community road safety partnerships is available through a number of sources including the Safe School Travel Program, advice and feedback to local government on development applications, the Safe Walking and Pedalling Program, the Community Road Safety Activity Fund, the School Crossing Supervisor Scheme, Transport Infrastructure Development Scheme, Road Safety Strategies and Action Plans, and the Queensland Police Service School Based Policing, Community Liaison and Support Program – Communities Supporting Police, Neighbourhood Watch, Police Beats, and Adopt-A-Cop program.

RECOMMENDATION 13

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government ensures that the criteria used for selecting sites for combined red light and speed cameras meet the requirements for both red light and speed cameras, rather than one or the other.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs

Response:

This recommendation is not supported.

Comment:

Intersection crashes account for approximately one in three of all fatal and serious injury crashes in Queensland. Research indicates casualty reductions can be made by reducing speed limits on the approaches to intersections.

Crashes that result from drivers running red lights can be particularly severe because they often involve the front of a vehicle impacting with the side doors of another vehicle. Passengers and drivers are not as well protected from side impacts as frontal impacts. Vulnerable road users such as pedestrians and cyclists also have a high presence at signalised intersections again increasing the need for reducing speeds at these intersections.

Red light cameras are only installed at intersections that have the highest number of crashes from disobeying signals. Speeding at intersection crashes is likely to be under-reported because the primary cause of an intersection crash is either failing to give way or failing to stop at a red light (even though speed is a contributing factor in many intersection crashes). Because of this, any criteria that require speed crash data will possibly fail to identify many high crash intersection locations, due to possible under reporting.

RECOMMENDATION 14

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government undertakes a process and outcome evaluation of all new speed enforcement technologies that they trial.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs and Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is supported.

Comment:

The camera technologies being used (and trialled) in Queensland are proven technologies. Each of the current trial digital cameras is being evaluated for performance inline with the new processing system.

The Queensland Police Service is of the view that any process and outcome evaluation of new technology is beneficial to continuous improvement.

The evaluation should be funded through Camera Detected Offence Program and conducted independently by a range of external research agencies.

The Queensland Police Service and the Department of Transport and Main Roads do actively engage external research bodies for the purpose of review and evaluation of road safety initiatives and programs.

The mobile speed camera program has been evaluated each year since its introduction. The Department of Transport and Main Roads noted in the whole-of-government submission that the department is working on a new evaluation framework. The framework will include models to evaluate mobile speed cameras, fixed speed cameras, combined red light/speed cameras and point-to-point speed camera systems.

RECOMMENDATION 15

The committee recommends that the Queensland Government tables in Queensland Parliament all evaluations recommended in this report within 12 months of the evaluation's completion date.

Ministerial responsibility:

Minister for Transport and Multicultural Affairs and Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services

Response:

This recommendation is partially supported.

Comment:

This recommendation is partially supported as rather than table the evaluations separately to the Queensland Parliament, they will be included in the next available Department of Transport and Mains Roads Annual Report. Annual Reports are tabled in Parliament. The findings will also be published on the Department of Transport and Main Roads and the Queensland Police Service websites.

Appendix A – History of Queensland’s Road Toll

