

1996–97

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF QUEENSLAND

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

NO. 52

SECOND SESSION OF THE FORTY–EIGHTH PARLIAMENT

THURSDAY, 20 MARCH 1997

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----|
| Absence of Premier | 518 |
| Adjournment | 526 |
| Attendance | 527 |
| Criminal Law Amendment Bill | 522 |
| Grievance Debate | 526 |
| Legal, Constitutional and Administrative Review Committee – Paper | 521 |
| Meeting of the House | 518 |
| Members' Ethics and Parliamentary Privileges Committee – Paper | 521 |
| Ministerial Statements— | |
| 1997 – Year of Training | 518 |
| Economic and jobs growth in Queensland | 518 |
| Land and Water Day in Primary Industries Week | 518 |
| Long term budgetary outlook | 518 |
| Queensland Cricket Team | 518 |
| Review of the Residential Tenancies Act | 518 |
| Seniors Card Business Discount Scheme | 518 |
| Motions without notice— | |
| Joint State/Commonwealth Public Accounts Committees Inquiry | 518 |
| Procedures for Witnesses appearing before Parliamentary Committees | 519 |
| Notice of Motion | 521 |
| Notice of Motion – Lack of economic strategy in Queensland | 525 |
| Petitions | 518 |
| Private Members' Statements | 521 |
| Questions without notice | 521 |

1 MEETING OF THE HOUSE

The House met at 9.30am pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (Honourable N J Turner) read prayers.

2 PETITIONS

The following petitions, lodged with The Clerk by the Members indicated, were received—

Mr Roberts, from 1,649 petitioners, requesting the House to immediately upgrade the Banyo Police Station to a Community Policing Project with increased resources and staff.

Mr Stephan, from 91 petitioners, requesting the House to (a) repeal the objection to release of information clause and (b) repeal the objection to contact clause thereby granting all pre 1991 adoptions the same rights as post 1991 adoptions.

Mr T Sullivan, from 170 petitioners, requesting the House to abandon the proposal to construct a fire station on the old K-Mart site at Chermside.

Dr Watson, from 170 petitioners, requesting the House to reject the plan to establish a freight rail line along the Southern by-pass and Gateway Arterial corridor, because of the considerable environmental and amenity problems this would cause.

3 MINISTERIAL STATEMENTS

- (a) Deputy Premier, Treasurer and Minister for the Arts (Mrs Sheldon), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to long term budgetary outlook.
- (b) Minister for Families, Youth and Community Care (Mr Lingard), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to the Seniors Card Business Discount Scheme.
- (c) Minister for Economic Development and Trade and Minister Assisting the Premier (Mr Slack), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to economic and jobs growth in Queensland.
- (d) Minister for Tourism, Small Business and Industry (Mr Davidson), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to a delegation led by Mr Cheung from Hebei Province, China.
- (e) Minister for Training and Industrial Relations (Mr Santoro), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to vocational education and training in Queensland and the launch of 1997 as the Year of Training.
- (f) Minister for Natural Resources (Mr Hobbs), by leave, made a ministerial statement announcing 20 March as Land and Water Day in Primary Industries Week.
- (g) Minister for Public Works and Housing (Mr Connor), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to the review of the *Residential Tenancies Act 1994*.

Paper: Mr Connor, during his statement, tabled the following paper—
Rules for Renting in Queensland – An evaluation of the first twelve months of operation of the *Residential Tenancies Act 1994*

- (h) Minister for Emergency Services and Minister for Sport (Mr Veivers), by leave, made a ministerial statement wishing the Queensland Cricket Team well for their Sheffield Shield final to be held from 21 March 1997.

4 ABSENCE OF PREMIER

Leader of Government Business (Mr FitzGerald) advised the House of the absence of the Premier (Mr Borbidge) who was attending a Premiers' Conference.

5 MOTION WITHOUT NOTICE – JOINT STATE/Commonwealth PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEES' INQUIRY

Leader of Government Business (Mr FitzGerald), by leave, moved—

- (1) That the Legislative Assembly, noting—

- (a) that the Queensland Public Accounts Committee is at present conducting an inquiry into Commonwealth and State accountability requirements for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island local government councils;
- (b) that the Commonwealth Joint Committee of Public Accounts is at present conducting an inquiry into the same matter; and
- (c) that the two committees have agreed to work together in their inquiries into this matter in order that the Senate and the House of Representatives and the Legislative Assembly of Queensland will have the benefit of comprehensive reports taking account of federal and state issues;

authorises the Queensland Public Accounts Committee to confer and sit with the Commonwealth Joint Committee of Public Accounts in connection with the consideration of Commonwealth and State accountability requirements for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island local government councils.

- (2) That, at meetings for the purposes of the proceedings authorised by paragraph (1) of this resolution—
 - (a) Members appointed to the Queensland Public Accounts Committee are authorised to participate in the proceedings;
 - (b) at all times during such proceedings, the presence of 3 members of the Queensland Public Accounts Committee will be necessary to constitute a quorum;
 - (c) the Chairman or the Vice Chairman of the Commonwealth Joint Committee of Public Accounts or the Chair or Deputy Chair of the Public Accounts Committee of the Legislative Assembly of Queensland shall preside; and
 - (d) the determination of questions and the examination of witnesses by the Members of the Queensland Public Accounts Committee shall be conducted in accordance with the procedures applicable to Committees of the Legislative Assembly in so far as those procedures are applicable.
- (3) That, for the purposes of its report to the Legislative Assembly on Commonwealth State accountability requirements for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island local government councils, the Queensland Public Accounts Committee may consider and make use of any information gained as a result of the proceedings authorised by this resolution.
- (4) That the foregoing provisions of this resolution, so far as they are inconsistent with the Standing Orders and Sessional Orders, has effect notwithstanding anything contained in the Standing or Sessional Orders.
- (5) That Mr Speaker be authorised to acquaint the President and members of the Senate and the Speaker and members of the House of Representatives of this Resolution.

Motion agreed to.

6 MOTION WITHOUT NOTICE – PROCEDURES FOR WITNESSES APPEARING BEFORE PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEES

Leader of Government Business (Mr FitzGerald), by leave, moved—

That, in their dealings with witnesses, and subject to the specific terms under which any committee is established (particularly any power to summons witnesses or documents) all committees of the Assembly should observe the following procedures—

- (1) A witness shall be invited to attend a committee meeting to give evidence. A witness shall be summoned to appear (whether or not the witness was previously invited to appear) only where the committee has made a decision that the circumstances warrant the issue of a summons.
- (2) Where a committee desires that a witness produce documents relevant to the committee's inquiry, the witness shall be invited to do so, and an order that documents be produced shall be made (whether or not an invitation to produce

documents has previously been made) only where the committee has made a decision that the circumstances warrant such an order.

- (3) A witness shall be given reasonable notice of a meeting at which the witness is to appear and shall be supplied an explanation of the matters expected to be dealt with during the witness's appearance, and a copy of these procedures. Where appropriate, as determined by the committee, a witness shall be supplied with a transcript of the relevant evidence already taken.
- (4) Where practicable a witness shall be given an opportunity to make a submission in writing before appearing to give oral evidence.
- (5) A witness shall be given reasonable access to any documents that the witness has produced to a committee.
- (6) A witness shall be offered, before giving evidence, the opportunity to make application, before or during the hearing of the witness's evidence, for any or all of the witness's evidence to be heard in private session, and shall be invited to give reasons for any such application. If the application is not granted, the witness shall be notified of reasons for that decision.
- (7) Before giving any evidence in private session a witness shall be informed whether it is the intention of the committee to publish or present to the Assembly all or part of that evidence. The witness shall also be informed that it is within the power of the committee to decide to publish evidence, and that the Assembly has the authority to order the production and publication of undisclosed evidence.
- (8) Before the committee publishes any evidence given in private session it shall provide a witness the opportunity to make a submission as to whether such evidence should be published.
- (9) A chairman of a committee shall take care to ensure that all questions put to witnesses are relevant to the committee's inquiry and that the information sought by those questions is necessary for the purpose of that inquiry. Where a member of a committee requests discussion of a ruling of the chairman on this matter, the committee shall deliberate in private session and determine whether any question which is the subject of the ruling is to be permitted.
- (10) Where a witness objects to answering any question put to the witness on any ground, including the ground that the question is not relevant or that the answer may incriminate the witness, the witness shall be invited to state the ground upon which objection to answering the question is taken. Unless the committee determines immediately that the question should not be pressed, the committee shall then consider in private session whether it will insist upon an answer to the question, having regard to the relevance of the question to the committee's inquiry, the importance to the inquiry of the information sought by the question and any statute regulating such questioning. Where a witness declines to answer a question to which a committee has required an answer, the committee shall report the facts to the Assembly or follow any other statutory requirements.
- (11) Where a committee has reason to believe that evidence about to be given may reflect adversely on a person, or where the witness otherwise requests, the committee shall give consideration to hearing that evidence in private session.
- (12) Where a witness gives evidence reflecting adversely on a person and the committee is not satisfied that the evidence is relevant to the committee's inquiry, the committee shall give consideration to expunging that evidence from the transcript of evidence, and to forbidding the publication of that evidence.
- (13) Where evidence is given which reflects adversely on a person and action of the kind referred to in paragraph (12) is not taken in respect of the evidence, the committee shall provide reasonable opportunity for that person to have access to that evidence and to respond to that evidence by written submission and/or appearance before the committee, as determined to be appropriate in all the circumstances by the committee.

- (14) A witness may make application to be accompanied by a legal adviser and to consult the legal adviser in the course of a meeting at which the witness appears. In considering such an application, a committee shall have regard to the need for the witness to be accompanied by a legal adviser to ensure the proper protection of the witness. If an application is not granted the witness shall be notified of reasons for that decision. Unless otherwise determined, the legal adviser is confined to advising the witness on their rights and may not address the committee.
- (15) An officer of a department of the Commonwealth or of the State shall not be asked to give opinions on matters of policy, and shall be given reasonable opportunity to refer questions asked of the officer to superior officers or to a Minister.
- (16) Reasonable opportunity shall be afforded to witnesses to make corrections of errors of transcription in the transcript of their evidence and to put before a committee additional material supplementary to their evidence.
- (17) Where a committee has any reason to believe that any person has been improperly influenced in respect of evidence which may be given before the committee, or has been subjected to or threatened with any penalty or injury in respect of any evidence given, the committee shall take all reasonable steps to ascertain the facts of the matter. Where the committee considers that the facts disclose that a person may have been improperly influenced or subjected to or threatened with penalty or injury in respect of evidence which may be or has been given before the committee, the committee shall report the facts and its conclusions to the Assembly.

Motion agreed to.

7 LEGAL, CONSTITUTIONAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW COMMITTEE – PAPER

Chairman of the Legal, Constitutional and Administrative Review Committee (Mrs Gamin) tabled the following paper—

Legal, Constitutional and Administrative Review Committee—
Report on the Electoral Amendment Bill 1996 (Report No. 5)

8 MEMBERS' ETHICS AND PARLIAMENTARY PRIVILEGES COMMITTEE – PAPER

Chairman of the Members' Ethics and Parliamentary Privileges Committee (Mrs Warwick) tabled the following paper—

Members' Ethics and Parliamentary Privileges Committee—
Report on a Citizens' Right-of-Reply No. 1 – A response to matters raised in the Legislative Assembly on 31 October 1996 (Report No. 5)

9 NOTICE OF MOTION

10 PRIVATE MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

Private Members' statements were made.

11 QUESTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Questions without notice were asked.

Paper: Minister for Emergency Services and Minister for Sport (Mr Veivers) tabled the following paper—
Memorandum, dated 20 March 1997, in relation to the employment of Ms Lyn Staib

Questions continued.

Paper: Leader of the Opposition (Mr Beattie) tabled the following paper—
Statutory Declaration, dated 19 March 1997, by Dr Leo Keliher

Questions continued.

Paper: Mr T Sullivan tabled the following paper—
Statutory Declaration, dated 28 November 1996, by Mr Michael Bertram

Questions continued.
Questions concluded.

12 CRIMINAL LAW AMENDMENT BILL

Order of the day read for the adjourned debate on the motion of the Attorney-General and Minister for Justice (Mr Beanland) – That the Bill be now read a second time.
Debate resumed.

Papers: Mr Beanland, during his speech, tabled the following papers—
Extracts, dated 15 and 16 June 1995, from Hansard

Debate continued.
Question put.
The House divided.

AYES, 41

| | | | | |
|------------|---------|-------------|-------------|---------|
| Baumann | Gamin | Laming | Radke | Veivers |
| Beanland | Gilmore | Lester | Rowell | Warwick |
| Carroll* | Goss, J | Lingard | Santoro | Watson |
| Connor | Grice | Littleproud | Simpson | Wilson |
| Cooper | Healy | McCauley | Slack | Woolmer |
| Cunningham | Hegarty | Malone | Springborg* | |
| Davidson | Hobbs | Mitchell | Stephan | |
| Elliott | Horan | Perrett | Stoneman | |
| FitzGerald | Johnson | Quinn | Tanti | |

NOES, 40

| | | | | |
|-----------|----------|--------------|------------|--------------|
| Ardill | Campbell | Gibbs | Milliner | Rose |
| Barton | D'Arcy | Goss, W | Mulherin | Schwarten |
| Beattie | De Lacy | Hamill | Nunn | Smith |
| Bird | Dollin | Hayward | Nuttall | Spence |
| Bligh | Edmond | Hollis | Palaszczuk | Sullivan, J |
| Braddy | Elder | Livingstone* | Purcell | Sullivan, T* |
| Bredhauer | Foley | Lucas | Roberts | Welford |
| Briskey | Fouras | Mackenroth | Robertso | Wells |

*Pairs – Messrs Borbidge and Harper and Mrs Sheldon (AYES) and
Messrs McElligott, McGrady and Pearce (NOES)*

**Tellers*

Question agreed to.
Bill read a second time.
Bill committee on the motion of Mr Beanland.

In Committee

In the Chair – The Chairman
Clauses 1 to 3 agreed to.

Clause 4 (*Amendment of s 6 (Civil remedies)*)—

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Foley—

At page 11, line 1, 'indictable offence'—

omit, insert—

'offence against the Criminal Code, section 419'.

Debate ensued.

Question put – That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the Clause.
The Committee divided.

AYES, 42

| | | | | |
|------------|---------|-------------|-------------|---------|
| Baumann | Gamin | Johnson | Radke | Turner |
| Beanland | Gilmore | Lester | Rowell | Veivers |
| Carroll* | Goss, J | Lingard | Santoro | Warwick |
| Connor | Grice | Littleproud | Simpson | Watson |
| Cooper | Harper | McCauley | Slack | Wilson |
| Cunningham | Healy | Malone | Springborg* | Woolmer |
| Davidson | Hegarty | Mitchell | Stephan | |
| Elliott | Hobbs | Perrett | Stoneman | |
| FitzGerald | Horan | Quinn | Tanti | |

NOES, 41

| | | | | |
|-----------|---------|--------------|------------|--------------|
| Ardill | D'Arcy | Hamill | Nuttall | Spence |
| Barton | De Lacy | Hayward | Palaszczuk | Sullivan, J |
| Beattie | Dollin | Hollis | Pearce | Sullivan, T* |
| Bird | Edmond | Livingstone* | Purcell | Welford |
| Bligh | Elder | Lucas | Roberts | Wells |
| Braddy | Foley | Mackenroth | Robertson | |
| Bredhauer | Fouras | Milliner | Rose | |
| Briskey | Gibbs | Mulherin | Schwarten | |
| Campbell | Goss, W | Nunn | Smith | |

Pairs – Mr Borbidge and Mrs Sheldon (AYES) and Messrs McElligott and McGrady (NOES)

**Tellers*

Question agreed to.

Amendment negated.

Clause 4, as read, agreed to.

Clause 5 agreed to.

Clause 6 (*Amendment of s 1 (Construction of terms)*)—

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Foley—

At page 11, after line 22—

insert—

“consent”—

1. “Consent” means consent freely and voluntarily given by a person with the cognitive capacity to give the consent.
2. Without limiting subsection (1), consent is freely and voluntarily given if it is not obtained—
 - (a) by force, threat, intimidation or deception; or
 - (b) by exercise of authority.’.

Debate ensued.

Question put – That the words proposed to be inserted be so inserted.

The Committee divided.

AYES, 41

| | | | | |
|-----------|---------|--------------|------------|--------------|
| Ardill | D'Arcy | Hamill | Nuttall | Spence |
| Barton | De Lacy | Hayward | Palaszczuk | Sullivan, J |
| Beattie | Dollin | Hollis | Pearce | Sullivan, T* |
| Bird | Edmond | Livingstone* | Purcell | Welford |
| Bligh | Elder | Lucas | Roberts | Wells |
| Braddy | Foley | Mackenroth | Robertson | |
| Bredhauer | Fouras | Milliner | Rose | |
| Briskey | Gibbs | Mulherin | Schwarten | |
| Campbell | Goss, W | Nunn | Smith | |

NOES, 42

| | | | | |
|------------|---------|-------------|-------------|---------|
| Baumann | Gamin | Johnson | Radke | Turner |
| Beanland | Gilmore | Lester | Rowell | Veivers |
| Carroll* | Goss, J | Lingard | Santoro | Warwick |
| Connor | Grice | Littleproud | Simpson | Watson |
| Cooper | Harper | McCauley | Slack | Wilson |
| Cunningham | Healy | Malone | Springborg* | Woolmer |
| Davidson | Hegarty | Mitchell | Stephan | |
| Elliott | Hobbs | Perrett | Stoneman | |
| FitzGerald | Horan | Quinn | Tanti | |

Pairs – Mr Borbidge and Mrs Sheldon (AYES) and Messrs McElligott and McGrady (NOES)

**Tellers*

Question negated.

Clause 6, as read, agreed to.

Clauses 7 to 16 agreed to.

New Clause—

The following new clause was proposed by Mr Foley—

At page 18, after line 15—

insert—

‘Amendment of s 87 (Official corruption)

‘16A. Section 87—

insert—

‘(1A) If the offence is committed by or in relation to a Minister of the Crown, as the holder of public office mentioned in subsection (1), the offender is liable to imprisonment for 14 years, and to be fined at the discretion of the court.’.

Amendment agreed to.

New Clause 16A agreed to.

Clauses 17 to 31 agreed to.

Clause 32 (*Replacement of s 222 (Incest by man)*)—

Debate ensued.

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Beanland—

At page 28, after line 31—

insert—

‘(7) Also, for subsection (5), a reference to a step relationship does not include a step relationship that first arose after the relevant persons became adults.

Debate ensued.

Amendment agreed to.

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Beanland—

After new subsection (7)—

insert—

‘(8) This section does not apply to carnal knowledge between persons who are lawfully married or entitled to be lawfully married.’.

Amendment agreed to.

Question put – That the clause, as amended, be agreed to.

The Committee divided.

AYES, 41

Baumann
Beanland
Carroll*
Connor
Cooper
Cunningham
Davidson
Elliott
FitzGerald

Gamin
Gilmore
Goss, J
Grice
Harper
Healy
Hegarty
Hobbs
Horan

Johnson
Lester
Lingard
Littleproud
McCauley
Malone
Perrett
Quinn
Radke

Rowell
Santoro
Simpson
Slack
Springborg*
Stephan
Stoneman
Tanti
Turner

Veivers
Warwick
Watson
Wilson
Woolmer

NOES, 40

Ardill
Barton
Beattie
Bligh
Braddy
Bredhauer
Briskey
Campbell

D'Arcy
De Lacy
Dollin
Edmond
Elder
Foley
Fouras
Gibbs

Goss, W
Hamill
Hayward
Hollis
Livingstone*
Lucas
Mackenroth
Milliner

Mulherin
Nunn
Nuttall
Palaszczuk
Pearce
Purcell
Roberts
Robertson

Rose
Schwarten
Smith
Spence
Sullivan, J
Sullivan, T*
Welford
Wells

*Pairs – Messrs Borbidge and Mitchell and Mrs Sheldon (AYES) and
Mrs Bird and Messrs McElligott and McGrady (NOES)*

**Tellers*

Question agreed to.

Clause 32, as amended, agreed to.

Clauses 33 to 46 agreed to.

Clause 47 (*Amendment of s 313 (Killing unborn child)*)—

The following amendment was proposed by Mrs Cunningham—

At page 36, lines 26 to 28 and page 37, lines 1 to 6—

omit, insert—

‘(2) Any person who unlawfully assaults a female pregnant with a child and destroys the life of, or does grievous bodily harm to, or transmits a serious disease to, the child before its birth, commits a crime.

Maximum penalty—imprisonment for life.’.

Debate ensued.

Temporary Chairman Miss Simpson took the Chair.

Amendment agreed to.

Clause 47, as amended, agreed to.

Clauses 48 to 59 agreed to.

Clause 60 (*Amendment of s 340 (Serious assaults)*)—

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Foley—

At page 45, after line 5—

insert—

'(3) Section 340—

insert—

'(g) assaults any person who is 60 years or more; or

(h) assaults any person who relies on a guide dog, wheelchair or other remedial device;'

'(4) Section 340, at the end—

insert—

'Examples of remedial device for paragraph (h)—

walking frame, caliper, walking stick and artificial limb.'

Debate ensued.

Question put – That the words proposed to be inserted be so inserted.

The Committee divided.

AYES, 41

Ardill
Barton
Beattie
Bligh
Braddy
Bredhauer
Briskey
Campbell
Cunningham

D'Arcy
De Lacy
Dollin
Edmond
Elder
Foley
Fouras
Gibbs
Goss, W

Hamill
Hayward
Hollis
Livingstone*
Lucas
Mackenroth
Milliner
Mulherin
Nunn

Nuttall
Palaszczuk
Pearce
Purcell
Roberts
Robertson
Rose
Schwarten
Smith

Spence
Sullivan, J
Sullivan, T*
Welford
Wells

NOES, 40

Baumann
Beanland
Carroll*
Connor
Cooper
Davidson
Elliott
FitzGerald

Gamin
Gilmore
Goss, J
Grice
Harper
Healy
Hegarty
Hobbs

Horan
Johnson
Laming
Lester
Lingard
Littleproud
McCauley
Malone

Perrett
Quinn
Radke
Rowell
Santoro
Slack
Springborg*
Stephan

Stoneman
Tanti
Turner
Veivers
Warwick
Watson
Wilson
Woolmer

*Pairs – Mrs Bird and Messrs McElligott and McGrady (AYES) and
Messrs Borbidge and Mitchell and Mrs Sheldon (NOES)*

**Tellers*

Question agreed to.

Clause 60, as amended, agreed to.

Clause 61—

Debate ensued.

Ordered – That the Temporary Chairman report progress and ask leave to sit again.

Mr Speaker resumed the Chair.

The Temporary Chairman reported that the Committee had considered the Bill, made progress, and asked leave to sit again.

Ordered – That further consideration of the Bill in Committee of the Whole House be made an order of the day for tomorrow

13 NOTICE OF MOTION – LACK OF ECONOMIC STRATEGY IN QUEENSLAND

Leader of the Opposition (Mr Beattie), pursuant to notice, moved—

That this House condemns the arrogant disregard of the Premier and his Treasurer for the economic wellbeing of Queensland, and in particular young Queenslanders, by demonstrating their sheer bumbling incompetence by—

- (1) refusing to develop economic strategies and policies to deal with the worst unemployment in mainland Australia, a retail sales slump and faltering recovery in the building sector;
- (2) failing to present an economic blueprint which can give the State investment community confidence in the future economic management of the State;
- (3) driving mining investment away from the State, as demonstrated by a 36% drop in quarterly mineral exploration, through confrontationalist policies on native title issues;

- (4) failing to stand up to the Commonwealth to win appropriate funding for State services;
- (5) conducting Government as a series of reviews, freezes and overturned decisions; and
- (6) their repeated inability to spend their capital works budget.

Debate ensued.

Papers: Mr Beattie, during his speech, tabled the following papers—
Letter, dated 31 January 1997, to the Prime Minister from Mr Beattie
Opposition Discussion Paper Outline entitled “A Return to Honest Government
in Queensland”
“Jobs for Queensland” launched by Mr Beattie on 2 February 1997

Debate continued.

Question put.

The House divided.

AYES, 39

| | | | | |
|-----------|---------|--------------|-----------|--------------|
| Ardill | D'Arcy | Hamill | Mulherin | Rose |
| Barton | Dollin | Hayward | Nunn | Schwarten |
| Beattie | Edmond | Hollis | Nuttall | Spence |
| Bligh | Elder | Livingstone* | Palaszcuk | Sullivan, J |
| Braddy | Foley | Lucas | Pearce | Sullivan, T* |
| Bredhauer | Fouras | Mackenroth | Purcell | Welford |
| Briskey | Gibbs | McGrady | Roberts | Wells |
| Campbell | Goss, W | Milliner | Robertson | |

NOES, 40

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|-------------|---------|-------------|
| Baumann | FitzGerald | Hobbs | Malone | Springborg* |
| Beanland | Gamin | Horan | Perrett | Stephan |
| Carroll* | Gilmore | Johnson | Quinn | Tanti |
| Connor | Goss, J | Laming | Radke | Veivers |
| Cooper | Grice | Lester | Rowell | Warwick |
| Cunningham | Harper | Lingard | Santoro | Watson |
| Davidson | Healy | Littleproud | Simpson | Wilson |
| Elliott | Hegarty | McCauley | Slack | Woolmer |

*Pairs – Mrs Bird, Messrs De Lacy, McElligott and Smith (AYES) and
Messrs Borbidge and Mitchell, Mrs Sheldon and Mr Stoneman (NOES)*

**Tellers*

Question negated.

14 GRIEVANCE DEBATE

Grievances were debated.

Paper: Mr Foley, during his speech, tabled the following paper—
Letter, dated 7 March 1997, to Honourable J M Sheldon, MLA from Chris
Stannard

Grievances continued.

Grievances concluded.

15 ADJOURNMENT

Leader of Government Business (Mr FitzGerald) moved – That this House do now adjourn.

Question put and passed.

The House adjourned at 7.30pm.

16 ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present—

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|-------------|------------|-------------|
| Ardill | De Lacy | Healy | Mitchell | Simpson |
| Barton | Dollin | Hegarty | Mulherin | Slack |
| Baumann | Edmond | Hobbs | Nunn | Smith |
| Beanland | Elder | Hollis | Nuttall | Spence |
| Beattie | Elliott | Horan | Palaszczuk | Springborg |
| Bird | FitzGerald | Johnson | Pearce | Stephan |
| Bligh | Foley | Laming | Perrett | Stoneman |
| Braddy | Fouras | Lester | Purcell | Sullivan, J |
| Bredhauer | Gamin | Lingard | Quinn | Sullivan, T |
| Briskey | Gibbs | Littleproud | Radke | Tanti |
| Campbell | Gilmore | Livingstone | Roberts | Veivers |
| Carroll | Goss, J | Lucas | Robertson | Warwick |
| Connor | Goss, W | Mackenroth | Rose | Watson |
| Cooper | Grice | McCauley | Rowell | Welford |
| Cunningham | Hamill | McGrady | Santoro | Wells |
| D'Arcy | Harper | Malone | Schwarten | Wilson |
| Davidson | Hayward | Milliner | Sheldon | Woolmer |

N J TURNER
Speaker

R D DOYLE
The Clerk of the Parliament