

Estimates Committee G

Report No. 1, 8 October 1996

Department of Health

Department of Families, Youth and Community Care

Laid on the table and ordered to be printed. Estimates Committee G

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE G

**REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF
QUEENSLAND**

8 October 1996

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE G

MEMBERS

Mrs Judy Gamin MLA (Chair)
Member for Burleigh

Mrs Wendy Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Member for Mt Coot-tha

Hon Jim Elder MLA
Member for Capalaba

Miss Fiona Simpson MLA
Member for Maroochydore

Mrs Margaret Woodgate MLA
Member for Kurwongbah

Mr Luke Woolmer MLA
Member for Springwood

SECRETARIAT

Mr Les Dunn
Research Director

Ms Belinda Noakes
Research Officer

Ms Maureen Barnes
Executive Assistant

CONTENTS

	Page
PREFACE	i
REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY	1
INTRODUCTION.....	1
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH.....	1
Introduction	1
Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Health.....	2
Capital Works	2
Recurrent cost funding model.....	2
Government Medical Officers.....	2
Residential care	3
Community health/disability services	3
Mental health	4
District Health Councils	4
Corporate services	4
Budget Process	4
Waiting lists at Prince Charles Hospital	5
DEPARTMENT OF FAMILIES, YOUTH AND COMMUNITY CARE	5
Introduction	5
Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs.....	6
Community Care	6
Disability	7
Families.....	8
Youth	8
Corporate Services.....	9
PROCEDURAL MATTERS	9
Powers of Committee Chair	9
Questions on Notice.....	9
Timekeeping	10
Concurrent Hearings	10
RECOMMENDATION.....	10
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	10
APPENDIX A — STATEMENTS OF RESERVATION BY NON-GOVERNMENT MEMBERS	
APPENDIX B — MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS.....	1
MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 11 SEPTEMBER 1996.....	1
MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 26 SEPTEMBER 1996.....	3
MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 27 SEPTEMBER 1996.....	8
MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 2 OCTOBER 1996	10

PREFACE

Estimates Committee G accepted the responsibility for examining the estimates for the Department of Health and the Department of Families, Youth and Community Care. Expenditure by these departments is a significant portion of the state budget.

As estimates committee hearings provide members of parliament with the opportunity to examine departmental budgets, all members were welcome to attend the hearing and put questions to the minister. Only members of Estimates Committee G attended the hearing.

There has been a considerable improvement in the estimates process since its introduction in 1994. The Ministerial Program Statements provide members with a clear, easy to understand budget overview for the portfolio and allow for reasonably valid comparison between budgetary years.

1996 saw the introduction of new sessional orders for the estimates process. This year each committee was able to place 20 questions on notice prior to the meeting and to request certain public officials to attend the hearing. The committee applauds any efforts to improve the effectiveness of the estimates process, however, it has mixed views on the effectiveness of some procedures and makes suggestions in regard to them and other matters in paragraphs 55-60 in its report.

Regardless of what procedural changes are brought in the committee believes the individual skill of members in interpreting the budget papers and asking pertinent questions will always be the underlying reason for success of the estimates process.

Thank you to my fellow committee members for their work on the committee and to the secretariat staff for their assistance.

Judy Gamin MLA
Chair

2 October 1996

REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

INTRODUCTION

1. The sessional orders adopted by the Legislative Assembly on 3 September 1996 established seven estimates committees to consider proposed expenditure under the *Appropriation Bill 1995* and the *Appropriation (Parliament) Bill 1995*. Also on that date the Legislative Assembly appointed members to the estimates committees. The Votes and Proceedings for that day formally records these matters.
2. Estimates Committee G was appointed to examine and report on the proposed expenditure for the organisational units within the portfolios of the following ministers:
 - Minister for Health
 - Minister for Families, Youth and Community Care.
3. The committee first met on Wednesday 11 September 1996. The committee elected Mrs Judy Gamin, Member for Burleigh, as chair and Mrs Wendy Edmond, Member for Mount Coot-tha, as deputy chair.
4. The committee conducted a public hearing on Thursday 26 September 1996 to hear evidence from the Minister for Health and the Minister for Families, Youth and Community Care. Additional information and answers to questions on notice are included in the 'Additional Information Folder' tabled with this report. Minutes of the committee's meetings are attached to this report.

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH**Introduction**

5. Queensland Health's purpose is to help people to better health and well being through health promotion, community development, disease surveillance, public health, operating nursing homes, special purpose long term facilities and inpatient facilities.
6. Queensland Health will refocus its priorities and services on providing access to health services close to where people live and work and producing health outcomes which contribute to their daily well-being. Key priorities are waiting time for hospital services, client satisfaction and service quality, participation and empowerment of staff and community, treatment outcomes from hospital services, independent accreditation for all services, capital works, health care reforms and health differentials for higher health risk groups such as rural, youth and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people.
7. Additional funding is provided in 1996-97 to address waiting times; enhance or expand services, particularly for people living outside the south-east corner of the State; accelerate the redevelopment and re-equipping of hospitals; and target the areas of mental health support for young people, home and community care, women's health and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander health. Internal savings will support increases in funding, redirecting funds from administration to service delivery.

8. Queensland Health's Consolidated Fund budget for 1996-97 will be \$3.011 billion, which is an increase of \$312 million (11.6%) on the 1995-96 budget.¹

Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Health

9. The budget for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander health programs over and above the services provided by the normal hospital system is \$6.6 million which is an increase of 60 percent on the 1995-96 budget. \$2 million of this is for a primary health care initiative, \$75,000 for a pneumococcal vaccination program, \$2.5 million (commonwealth funding) for a medical services indigenous agreement and \$535,000 (commonwealth funding) for a framework agreement between Queensland, the commonwealth government, ATSIC and the Queensland Aboriginal Islander Committee.

Capital Works

10. Queensland Health has budgeted for total capital works expenditure for the 1996/97 financial year of \$295.381 million. Of this amount \$254.24 million, which is part of the Hospital and Health Services Building Plan 1996-2006, is for hospitals. Under this program the government intends to commence rebuilding the state's metropolitan and provincial hospitals. \$22.575 million is for community health projects. The community program includes community based services and home care, plus rural and remote hospitals providing medical, surgical and maternity services. \$3.536 million is for mental health projects, \$1.656 million is for residential care projects. \$41.141 million is for pathology and scientific services projects.

Recurrent cost funding model

11. In response to a question on the recurrent cost funding model the minister said that to enable Queensland Health to meet its capital works expansion requirements, the department will implement a capital charge on additional money provided to fund the unfunded portions of the capital works program. The charge will be based on improved efficiency generated through the capital works projects. The charge will only be applied to hospitals which gain an improvement in operating efficiency through a new facility. Queensland Health estimates about \$1 billion of the hospital rebuilding funding will reduce the recurrent costs of operating Queensland hospitals.
12. The committee has some concerns with this model as the budget papers do not set out on what basis Queensland Health will negotiate with hospitals on what might be a reasonable capital charge. Queensland Health should specify this process as soon as possible.

Government Medical Officers

13. The committee asked the minister for information on the extended Government Medical Officer (GMO) services. Currently the GMO network is four full time GMOs with a network of private practitioners called in by police on a fee for service basis. The budget provides for two additional GMOs. One of these GMOs will be stationed

¹ *State Budget 1996-97, Budget Paper No. 2*

in the Beenleigh/Logan/Ipswich area and the other in Townsville. Also, GMOs will receive funding for training and support services. Over time the government intends to develop a state wide network of GMOs. A GMO state wide director will be appointed to coordinate training of GMOs and establish rosters, particularly of female GMOs to attend sexual assault cases. The scheme may also be extended to include registered nurses attending watchhouses to provide services, particularly in relation to medication.

Residential care

14. The services produced through this program area are specialised assessment and long term residential care. Service range includes nursing homes, hostels and other long term accommodation for older people, and residential care facilities for disabled people. The residential care budget for 1996/97 is \$143.830 million.
15. Among other projects, over the next year the government intends to improve compliance with Commonwealth Outcome Standards in State Government Nursing Homes, reduce delays in assessment by the Aged Care Assessment Teams and reduce the incidence of nursing home type patients in acute care.
16. Queensland Health told the committee that currently over 600 nursing home type patients are accommodated in acute care hospitals. However, many of these patients live in rural areas where no viable alternative accommodation exists. The committee queried whether Mount Olivet Hospital could be better utilised for accommodating nursing home type patients. The minister responded that the department has had meetings with Mount Olivet Hospital and is aiming to use Mount Olivet as much as possible and to ensure that the department gets value for money in its dealings with Mount Olivet.
17. Currently, there is a six day delay for assessment by the Aged Care Assessment Program. The performance management branch of Queensland Health is working to reduce the delay.

Community health/disability services

18. This service area includes clinical treatment, clinical support and non clinical support provided separately from the public hospital system to people in their usual home and community. The proposed budget for this program area is \$435.698 million.
 19. Services provided by Queensland Health are Community Care, Self Care, Home Care and Rural Health. The client base for this program is any person who requires non acute and post acute care, people with chronic conditions, people requiring palliative care, women requiring prenatal and post natal support and eligible people requiring oral health services.
 20. New initiatives in this area are the expansion of the Home and Community Care program, enhanced allied health outreach services for residents of rural and remote communities, increased numbers of child health nurses and the network of primary health care services extended to cover Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities in central and western Queensland.
-

Mental health

21. Queensland Health provides services in psychiatric hospitals, public hospitals and in the community. Services provided include referral, intake, assessment and continuing treatment. The services form a state wide specialised mental health network. The proposed budget for this program area is \$205.950 million, which is a 5.3% increase on the 1995-96 budget. A major new initiative in this area is the development of a '10 Year Mental Health Strategy' which will increase mental health services, recognise the rights of the mentally ill and recognise mental health services as a fundamental part of the health program.
22. Other new initiatives in this area include a new 12 bed Youth Mental Health Inpatient Unit at the Royal Brisbane Hospital, enhanced specialised community mental health services, a new mental health unit at Rockhampton Hospital and additional acute inpatient beds for mentally ill patients at Nambour Hospital. Queensland Health will employ extra psychiatric nurses and is aiming to establish a network throughout the state so that people can have 24 hour access to mental health services. An extra \$2.9 million has been provided for more community mental health workers.

District Health Councils

23. Queensland Health has dismantled its 13 health regions and replaced them with 39 districts. Each district will be run by a district health council which will enable community input to the operation of districts. District health councils will consist of 8 to 10 people. Through this administrative restructuring Queensland Health expects to save \$10 million in this financial year and \$13 million in future financial years. \$10 million in savings are a result of a reduction of about 200 positions within Queensland Health and a further \$3 million in savings are from changes to rental arrangements.

Corporate services

24. The Corporate Services program provides strategic policy, management, administration and professional advisory services necessary to run a modern health system. Queensland Health is restructuring its corporate services area to gain savings and provide a new focus for assistance to Queensland Health staff in the districts, in hospitals and in community health centres.

Budget Process

25. The committee is concerned by the confusion caused by Queensland Health's accounts in regard to hospital and district budgets. The committee believes that the budget papers and information published by Queensland Health should accurately indicate exactly what expenditure it includes in each budget category. For example, during the hearing there was considerable confusion over exact hospital budgets as opposed to district budgets. The committee believes more certainty in what is included in budget categories will improve public confidence in budgetary process.

Waiting lists at Prince Charles Hospital

26. Committee members sought information on the state of waiting lists for surgery at Prince Charles Hospital. The waiting list is divided into three categories. Category 1 is those patients needing surgery within 30 days, category 2 is 60 days and category 3 is 90 days. Currently, there are no long-wait category 1 patients waiting for surgery at Prince Charles Hospital.
27. The acting manager elective surgery told the committee funding was available for the waiting list backlog program; Hospital Access Program; the Home Support Scheme; special high priority projects and a special supplementation was recently made. An amount has been carried forward from last financial year. There is also an allocation for purchasing major medical equipment and a special allocation for minor medical equipment.

DEPARTMENT OF FAMILIES, YOUTH AND COMMUNITY CARE**Introduction**

28. The Department of Families, Youth and Community Care is committed to ensuring the development of social support services and community networks which are responsive to the needs of all Queenslanders. The department provides, or funds the non-government sector to provide, services to a wide range of clients including children in need of after-school care; youths appearing before the courts; abused children; people with disabilities; homeless persons; Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people; older people; welfare organisations; and families on drought affected farms.
29. Key initiatives of the department include the implementation of amendments to the *Juvenile Justice Act* which provides for improved rights of victims and options for tougher sentencing; the introduction of new standards by the end of 1997 for outside school hours care services; the provision of additional respite, counselling and other related services to people with disabilities and their carers; the establishment of a Children's Commissioner to investigate complaints by or on behalf of children; and significant increases in training, support and remuneration to carers of children placed in the care of the department. Operational efficiencies within the head office have been redirected to help address the cost of these additional services.
30. All figures reflect the transfer of youth services from the previous Department of Tourism, Sport and Youth and the transfer of ethnic affairs, youth detention centres and certain juvenile justice functions to various other departments.
31. The department's 1996-97 budget is \$499.2 million, an increase of \$39.8 million or 8.7% on the comparable budget for 1995-96.¹

¹ *State Budget 1996-97 Budget Paper No. 2*

Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs

32. The program facilitates effective and culturally appropriate government services by encouraging cooperation between other government agencies and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities. The program administers legislation governing Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander community councils, and manages retail outlets in several communities. Its budget for 1996-97 is \$48.395 million.
33. The major priority for the program in the next year is improving accountability in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island councils by recruiting additional staff to provide assistance and by monitoring government grants more closely.
34. Other key initiatives for the year include merging the functions of the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Overview Committee and the Aboriginal Justice Advisory Committee to use resources better and assist with oversight of Royal Commission Into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody recommendations.

Office Accommodation

35. The committee asked for information on capital works — in particular, council office accommodation — in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities. The minister stated that a total of \$8.5 million — \$2 million this year and \$6.5 million over the next 2 years — is allocated for new council offices and repairs to existing facilities throughout Cape York and the Torres Strait islands. This should help community councils achieve more satisfactory financial accountability.

Juvenile Justice

36. The committee expressed concern in relation to over-representation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander young people in the juvenile justice system. The minister provided the following statistics: Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders account for around 3.6% of young people aged between 10 and 16 in Queensland. As at 31 May 1996, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander youth accounted for approximately 35% of young people on immediate release orders, 42% of young people on community service orders and 56% of young people in detention.
37. The minister noted that these figures appear to be relatively stable at present. However, he stressed that they clearly show gross over-representation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander young people within the juvenile justice system. The minister indicated that community-based juvenile justice programs which provide alternatives to detention — for example, where a group of elders discipline young offenders — show promise as one effective way of addressing the problem and will be trialled.

Community Care

38. Community Care facilitates non-government human services delivery in Queensland. The program administers funding programs and provides developmental assistance for community-based service delivery to in the areas of ageing, concessions, child care, gambling addiction, family breakdown and domestic violence. It liaises with peak welfare bodies, coordinates funding for state-wide agencies and negotiates
-

State/Commonwealth funding arrangements. The program's budget for 1996-97 is \$160.586 million.

39. Key initiatives for the coming year include extra grants for outside school hours care services, introduction of a new schedule of fees for child care centre licensees, a review of the Emergency Relief Program and extension of access to the Seniors Card on a means-test-free basis to all people over 65 years not working full time.

Disability

40. The program develops and delivers services for people who have a disability. These services include policy advice and developmental support, and direct services like accommodation support and therapy for people with intellectual disabilities and support for their families and carers. The program has a budget of \$172.277 million for 1996-97.
41. Over the next year, the Disability program will provide funds to move residents of Challinor and Basil Stafford Centre to community living, but will also continue to support the operation of those centres. Some disability services will be transferred to the non-government sector over the next 2-3 years

Respite Care Services

42. The committee questioned the minister on \$4.1 million allocated over the next three years for the costs of transferring responsibility for some specialised disability services to the non-government sector. Specifically, the committee asked what those specialised services were. The minister indicated that the core services referred to included the provision of respite care services, provision of day activity services to people with an intellectual disability, and also provision of services to people with an intellectual disability who do not have severely disruptive behaviours (and therefore fall outside of the department's primary target group). The minister stressed his strong commitment to respite care centres, however they are funded.

Post-school Options for People with Disabilities

43. The committee sought information on funding for the trial Post School Option Programs. The minister indicated that the programs are presently very costly to run, but that total funding for the programs of \$2.69 million is budgeted for this financial year.

Social and Community Services (SACS) Award

44. The committee queried the estimated impact of the SACS award on costs incurred by the non-government sector in providing disability services relocated from the government sector. The minister indicated that some considerable uncertainty still exists in relation to the award's increased application, given that the Chamber of Commerce and Industry has launched an appeal against the decision. Nonetheless, the SACS award could result in substantial cost increases for the non-government sector. The minister indicated that, in this event, the department could make a special

application to Treasury for extra funds to assist those non-government organisations most affected.

Families

45. The Families program has statutory responsibility for the protection of children from abuse and neglect and for the provision of alternative care when necessary. The program also manages adoptions, provides a 24-hour telephone crisis response service and provides sexual abuse counselling. Its 1996-97 budget is \$69.686 million.
46. The major new initiative planned for the coming year is the establishment of a Children's Commission to deal with complaints from children, young people and adults, and to review the provision of children's services. The Children's Commissioner will establish Appeals Tribunals to hear appeals of reviewable decisions relating to children's services. Legislation to establish the Children's Commission is currently before the parliament.
47. Other initiatives include funding for extra family support workers, the introduction of new accredited competency standards and training courses for care providers accompanied by increases in allowances for care providers, and increased adoption fees.

Adoption

48. The committee expressed concern over substantial increases in adoption fees, and asked how much revenue the department expected to gain from the fee rises. The minister agreed that the Budget allowed for significant increases in fees for both local and overseas adoptions. He advised that the total annual cost to the department of all adoptions is currently \$760,000, but that the new fees were expected to raise only \$550,000. As such, he argued that the new fees would not raise any 'revenue' for the department and in fact would not even achieve full cost recovery. However, the minister acknowledged the existence of significant community concern over the fee rises, and indicated that the department would undertake a review of the costs of the adoption program, with particular emphasis on administration costs.

Youth

49. The Youth program identifies government youth policy directions, provides grants and developmental support to the community youth sector and attempts better coordination of youth policies and programs. The program also delivers initiatives aimed at preventing crime by young people, supports children who have been charged with offences and provides advice to the courts and legal representatives about juvenile crime. Its budget for 1996-97 is \$27.161 million.
50. In the next year, the program will develop a regime of procedures, practice standards, programs and case management systems to implement the new juvenile justice policy and amendments to the legislation. Youth Advisory Forums will continue, and the Youth Cultural Events Program will promote positive images of young people.

Juvenile Justice

51. The committee raised a number of concerns relating to juvenile justice, including the increase in the number of juveniles appearing in court and graffiti-related crime.
52. The minister stated that since 1994-95 the rate of court appearances by children has actually decreased in real terms. He noted that, although the number and proportion of matters committed to the higher courts has increased, the use of community-based orders such as probation and community service orders has also significantly increased. In particular, the minister pointed to the use of community service orders (cleaning up graffiti and other work activities) for juvenile offenders who vandalise and commit graffiti-related offences.

Corporate Services

53. The Corporate Services program provides financial, property and personnel management services, and information management services like Freedom of Information, information technology, publications, and records management to the department. It also provides executive support services like internal audit. The program has no specific budget allocation for 1996-97.
54. New initiatives for the year include a work related injury early intervention and workplace rehabilitation pilot, publication of the first 3-year Equal Employment Opportunity Plan, and development of new community information systems.

PROCEDURAL MATTERS

55. The committee is of the view that, generally, the estimates process works quite smoothly. The committee feels it necessary, however, to make comment on some aspects of the process with a view to achieving improved efficiency and effectiveness in the estimates process.

Powers of Committee Chair

56. During the committee's hearing there was a problem with some members persistently interjecting and engaging the minister in debate. The committee believes it is not the role of members of an estimates committee to debate with the minister. Accordingly the committee would like the sessional orders to empower the chair to deal with members who persistently interject or engage in debate with the minister. The committee believes a decision on what sanctions a chair may apply should rest with the Legislative Assembly. The committee believes the Legislative Assembly should alter sessional orders, for future estimates committees, to allow the chair to sanction unruly members.

Questions on Notice

57. Section 20(4) of the sessional orders sets out the criteria by which the minister may determine what is an onerous question. The committee believes these criteria should be more specific. The committee concedes that it is not easy to define what might be an 'unreasonably onerous' research requirement or what 'unnecessarily complex' means.

However, it believes the sessional orders should set down the number of sub-parts a question may have. Four sub-parts should be the maximum for questions on notice.

58. The committee also believes the sessional orders should accurately describe what is an admissible question and what factors may render a question inadmissible.

Timekeeping

59. Generally, the committee was happy with timekeeping arrangements. What would be beneficial, however, is an arrangement whereby committee members can tell how much questioning time is left. The committee believes a large clock facing the members, which can be reset at the beginning of each questioning period, would assist members to make best use of their questioning time.

Concurrent Hearings

60. Estimates committee reports, particularly those of committees whose hearings are held later, are produced within tight time lines. The committee believes having more time available to write reports would result in better quality estimates committee reports. Accordingly, the committee suggests that estimates committees' hearings be held concurrently. The committee believes the Legislative Assembly should investigate the feasibility of holding estimates committees' hearings concurrently.

RECOMMENDATION

61. The committee recommends that the proposed expenditures, stated in the *Appropriation Bill 1995* for the organisational units within the portfolios referred to Estimates Committee G for examination, be agreed to by the Legislative Assembly without amendment.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

62. The committee wishes to express its appreciation and thanks for the level of cooperation and assistance afforded to it by ministers and departmental staff. The committee also wishes to express its thanks to Hansard and committee secretariat staff.

Judy Gamin MLA
Chair

2 October 1996

APPENDIX A
STATEMENTS OF RESERVATION BY
NON-GOVERNMENT MEMBERS

APPENDIX B — MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 11 SEPTEMBER 1996****Minutes of a meeting of Estimates Committee G
held on Wednesday, 11 September 1996 at 12.10 pm
in Room 16.11, Level 16, Parliamentary Annexe.****Present:**

Mrs J Gamin MLA(Chair)
Mrs W Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Hon J Elder MLA
Miss F Simpson MLA
Mrs M Woodgate MLA
Mr L Woolmer MLA

In attendance:

Mr L Dunn, Research Director
Ms B Noakes, Research Officer

**Appointment of
members to the
committee:**

The research director read the resolution of appointment of members to Estimates Committee G of the Second Session of the Forty Eighth Parliament of the Legislative Assembly of Queensland.

Election of chair:

By leave of the committee, the research director proceeded to the election of the chair.

Mrs Gamin was nominated by Mrs Woodgate, and there being no further nominations was declared elected.

Mrs Gamin then took the chair and returned her thanks to the members.

**Election of deputy
chair:**

The chair proceeded to the election of the deputy chair. Mrs Edmond was nominated by Mrs Woodgate, and there being no further nominations was declared elected.

Questions on notice: On the motion of Mrs Edmond, seconded by Miss Simpson, it was resolved:

That both the opposition and government members provide the research director with their ten questions on notice on or before Wednesday 18 September 1996.

Order of appearance of departments: The committee agreed the following order:

9.00 am Department of Health

3.00 pm Department of Families, Youth & Community Care

Public officials to attend: On the motion of Miss Simpson, seconded by Mrs Woodgate, it was resolved:

That both the government and opposition members provide the research director with the names or positions of the public officials they require to attend the hearing on or before Wednesday 18 September 1996.

Filming of proceedings: On the motion of Miss Simpson, seconded by Mrs Edmond, it was resolved:

That conditional on what other committees decide, the committee allow filming for the purposes of file footage and of the introduction and change over of ministers.

Meeting schedule: The committee agreed on the following meeting schedule:

9.00 am Friday 27 September — discuss report issues

9.00 am Wednesday 2 October.

Adjournment: There being no further business, the committee adjourned at 12.45 pm until a date, time and place to be nominated by the chairman.

Confirmed this 26th day of September 1996

[Original Signed]

Chair

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 26 SEPTEMBER 1996**Minutes of a meeting of Estimates Committee G
held on Thursday, 26 September 1996 at 8.30 am
in Room B.27, Parliament House.****Present:**

Mrs J Gamin MLA(Chair)
Mrs W Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Hon J Elder MLA
Miss F Simpson MLA
Mrs M Woodgate MLA
Mr L Woolmer MLA

In attendance:

Mr L Dunn, Research Director
Ms B Noakes, Research Officer

**Confirmation of
minutes:**

On the motion of Mrs Woodgate, seconded by Miss Simpson, it was resolved:

That the minutes of the previous meeting held on 11 September 1996 be confirmed.

**Publication of
Questions on Notice:**

On the motion of Mrs Woodgate, seconded by Miss Simpson, it was resolved:

That pursuant to section 4, subsection 2(a) of the *Parliamentary Papers Act*, that the committee authorise for publication the Questions on Notice.

Questions on Notice:

The research director informed members that he had written to the Department of Health and Department of Families, Youth and Community Care asking for answers to questions put on notice at the hearing to be provided to the committee by Monday 30 September 1996.

Adjournment:

At 8.50 am the committee adjourned until 9.00 am, 26 September 1996 in the Legislative Council Chamber..

Confirmed this 2nd day of October 1996

[Original Signed]

Chair

**Minutes of a public hearing of Estimates Committee G
held on Thursday, 26 September 1996 at 9.00 am
in the Legislative Council Chamber, Parliament House.**

Present: Mrs J Gamin MLA(Chair)
Mrs W Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Hon J Elder MLA
Miss F Simpson MLA
Mrs M Woodgate MLA
Mr L Woolmer MLA

In attendance:
Mr L Dunn, Research Director
Ms B Noakes, Research Officer

Hearing: Public admitted. The chair opened the hearing and made a brief statement.

**Examination of
proposed expenditure:**

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

The chair declared the proposed expenditure for the Department of Health to be open for examination.

The question before the committee was ‘That the proposed expenditures be agreed to’.

In attendance was the Minister for Health, Hon Mike Horan MLA, accompanied by the following departmental officers:

Director-General	Dr Rob Stable
Deputy Director-General (Health Services)	Dr John Youngman
Deputy Director-General (Planning and Systems)	Mr Ross Pitt
Manager, Finance	Mr Alan Davis
A/Director, Capital Works and Asset Management	Mr David Jay
Manager, Facilities and Capital Development Unit	Mr Neil Otto
Manager, Casemix Development and Implementation Unit	Dr Glenn Cuffe
Manager, Mental Health Branch	Ms Libby Wherrett
A/Manager, Elective Surgery	Dr Michael Cleary

A/Manager, Older People's Health Program	Ms Jennie Pouwer
A/Manager, COAG Transition Unit	Ms Geri Taylor
Manager, Organisational Transition Unit	Ms Judith Robson
Senior Policy Officer, Health Economics Policy Unit	Ms Janelle Simpson
A/Director, Program Development Branch	Ms Vicki Assenheim
Principal Finance Officer (Budget), Finance Branch	Mr Stephen Crane
Chief Health Officer	Dr Diana Lange
A/Manager, Public Health	Dr John Scott
A/Manager, Internal Audit	Mr Tony Hayes

SUSPENSION OF HEARING

At 9.13 am the committee suspended the hearing.

IN PRIVATE SESSION

On the motion of Miss Simpson, seconded by Mr Woolmer, it was resolved:

That the chair's ruling on the minister's option to answer questions on matters of policy be accepted by the committee.

Debate ensued.

Question put.

The committee divided — Mrs Gamin in the chair.

'Ayes'	'Noes'
Mrs Gamin	Mrs Edmond
Miss Simpson	Mr Elder
Mr Woolmer	Mrs Woodgate

The number of the 'Ayes' and 'Noes' being equal the chair gave her casting vote to the 'Ayes'.

The resolution was resolved in the affirmative.

RESUMPTION OF HEARING

At 9.16 am the committee resumed the hearing

SUSPENSION OF HEARING

At 10.30 am the committee suspended the hearing.

RESUMPTION OF HEARING

At 10.55 am the committee resumed the hearing.

SUSPENSION OF HEARING

At 12.55 the committee suspended the hearing.

RESUMPTION OF HEARING

At 2.25 pm the committee resumed the hearing.

At 3.15 pm the committee concluded its examination and suspended the hearing. The witnesses withdrew.

DEPARTMENT OF FAMILIES, YOUTH AND COMMUNITY CARE

At 3.30 the chair declared the proposed expenditures for the Department of Families, Youth and Community Care to be open for examination.

The question before the committee was: 'That the proposed expenditures be agreed to'.

In attendance was the Minister for Families, Youth and Community Care, Hon Kevin Lindgard MLA, accompanied by the following departmental officers:

Director-General	Rev Allan Male
Deputy Director-General	Dr Peter Botsman
Director, Finance and Organisational Services	Mr Gary Clarke
A/Manager, Budget & Program Management Branch	Mr Arthur O'Brien
Director, Information Services	Ms Carmel Finn
Director, Office of Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander Affairs	Mr Jim Wauchope
A/Director, Regional Services Branch	Mr Trevor Satour
A/Head of Division of Community Services Development	Mr Peter Ryan

Director, Office of Child Care	Mr Mike Wills
Financial Co-ordinator, Planning & Policy Co-ordination Branch	Mr Russell Loos
A/Asst Divisional Head, Community & Youth Branch	Ms Diann Dwyer
A/Executive Director, Division of Disability Services	Mr Geoff Rowe
Manager, Planning & Co-ordination Branch	Mr Mike Lewis
A/Head of Division of Protective Services and Juvenile Justice	Mr Shane Ryan
Principal Child Protection Officer	Ms Anne-Louise Nilsson
A/Director, Juvenile Justice	Mr Ken Otter
A/Manager, Program Development, Juvenile Justice	Mr Garry Thompson
Manager, Youth Bureau	Ms Grazia Catalano

SUSPENSION OF HEARING

At 4.58 pm the committee suspended the hearing.

RESUMPTION OF HEARING

At 5.15 pm the committee resumed the hearing.

SUSPENSION OF HEARING

At 6.40 pm the committee suspended the hearing.

RESUMPTION OF HEARING

At 6.48 the committee resumed the hearing.

At 7.25 pm the committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

Adjournment:

At 7.27 pm the committee adjourned until 9.00 am, Friday 27 September 1996 in Room 5.04, Parliamentary Annexe.

Confirmed this 2nd day of October 1996

[Original Signed]

Chair

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 27 SEPTEMBER 1996**Minutes of a meeting of Estimates Committee G
held on Friday, 27 September 1996 at 9.00 am
in Room 5.04, Level 5, Parliamentary Annexe.****Present:**

Mrs J Gamin MLA(Chair)
Mrs W Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Miss F Simpson MLA
Mrs M Woodgate MLA
Mr L Woolmer MLA

In attendance:

Mr L Dunn, Research Director
Ms B Noakes, Research Officer

Apologies:

Hon J Elder MLA

**Details of printing the
Estimates G report:**

The chair outlined the critical dates for the report printing timetable.

The research director informed members that dissenting reports must be back to him by 3.00 pm, Thursday 3 October 1996.

**Answers by the
Minister for Health:**

Mrs Edmond asked that the minutes record her dissatisfaction with the answers provided to the committee, during the public hearing, by the Minister for Health.

Mrs Edmond will record her concerns in a dissenting report.

**Powers of committee
chair recommendation:**

On the motion of Miss Simpson, seconded by Mr Woolmer, it was resolved:

That, in its report, the committee include a recommendation that the sessional orders set out more clearly the powers of the committee chair in dealing with consistent interjection by committee members.

- Question on Notice recommendation:** On the motion of Mr Woolmer, seconded by Miss Simpson, it was resolved:
- That, in its report, the committee include a recommendation that section 20 of the sessional orders provide
- (a) a definition of ‘onerous’
 - (b) a definition of what is an admissible question.
- Public hearing timekeeping recommendation:** On the motion of Miss Simpson, seconded by Mr Woolmer, it was resolved:
- That, in its report, the committee include a recommendation that during estimates committee hearings, there is a clock available to members which shows how much questioning time is left during each segment.
- Concurrent estimates committee hearings recommendation:** On the motion of Mrs Edmond, seconded by Mr Woolmer, it was resolved:
- That, in its report, the committee include a recommendation that estimates committee hearings be held concurrently.
- Report issues:** The committee deliberated.
- Adjournment:** The committee adjourned to 9.00 am, 2 October 1996 in Room 5.04, Parliamentary Annexe.

Confirmed this 2nd day of October 1996

[Original Signed]

Chair

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS HELD 2 OCTOBER 1996**Minutes of a meeting of Estimates Committee G
held on Wednesday, 2 October 1996 at 9.07 am
in Room 5.04, Level 5, Parliamentary Annexe.**

- Present:** Mrs J Gamin MLA (Chair)
Mrs W Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Miss F Simpson MLA
Mrs M Woodgate MLA
Mr L Woolmer MLA
- In attendance:
Mr L Dunn, Research Director
Ms B Noakes, Research Officer
- Apologies:** Mr J Elder MLA
- Confirmation of minutes:** On the motion of Mrs Woodgate, seconded by Miss Simpson, it was resolved:

That the minutes of the previous meetings held on 26 & 27 September 1996 be confirmed.
- Chair's draft report:** The chair tabled her draft report for consideration at the committee's next meeting.
- Answers to questions on notice:** The committee agreed that all answers to questions on notice had been received.
- Adjournment:** At 9.24 am the committee adjourned until 9.25 am in Room 5.04, Parliamentary Annexe.

Certified correct this 2nd day of October 1996

Research Director

**Minutes of a meeting of Estimates Committee G
held on Wednesday, 2 October 1996 at 9.25 am
in Room 5.04, Level 5, Parliamentary Annexe.**

Present: Mrs J Gamin MLA(Chair)
Mrs W Edmond MLA (Deputy Chair)
Miss F Simpson MLA
Mrs M Woodgate MLA
Mr L Woolmer MLA

In attendance:
Mr L Dunn, Research Director
Ms B Noakes, Research Officer

Apologies: Mr J Elder MLA

**Adoption of chair's
draft report as the
committee's report:**

The committee deliberated.

PARAGRAPH	DECISION
Chair's preface	As amended
1-9	Agreed to
10	As amended
11	Agreed to
12	As amended
13-23	Agreed to
24	As amended
25	As amended
26	Agreed to
27	As amended
28-62	Agreed to

On the motion of Mrs Edmond, seconded by Mr Woolmer, it was resolved:

That the chair's draft report be adopted as the report of the committee.

Dissenting reports: On the motion of Mrs Edmond, seconded by Mrs Woodgate, it was resolved:

That committee members must return dissenting reports to the research director by 3.00 pm, 3 October 1996.

Adjournment: At 9.26 am there being no further business committee adjourned sine die.

Certified correct this 2nd day of October 1996

Research Director