



ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF QUEENSLAND

**Office of the Governor
Queensland Audit Office
Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations
Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development
Treasury Department
Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning and
Office of Rural Communities**

6430.

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF QUEENSLAND

13 June 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tom Barton MLA
(Member for Waterford)

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON: Mr John Budd MLA
(Member for Redlands)

MEMBERS: Mr Rob Borbidge MLA
(Member for Surfers Paradise)

Mr Ken Davies MLA
(Member for Mundingburra)

Mrs Di McCauley MLA
(Member for Callide)

Mr Bill Nunn MLA
(Member for Hervey Bay)

Mrs Joan Sheldon MLA
(Member for Caloundra)

RESEARCH DIRECTOR: Mr Darrell Martin

SENIOR RESEARCH OFFICER: Mr David Thannhauser

CONTENTS

	Page
REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY	1
Introduction	1
Estimates for the Office of the Governor	2
Estimates for the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations ...	2
Estimates for the Queensland Audit Office	2
Estimates for the Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development ..	2
Estimates for the Treasury Department	3
Estimates for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning	5
The Estimates Committee Procedure	6
Conclusion	6
Recommendation	6
STATEMENT OF RESERVATIONS BY MINORITY	7
MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS	11
Minutes of Meeting held 22 May 1995	11
Minutes of Meeting held 29 May 1995	14
Minutes of Proceedings held 30 May 1995	15
Minutes of Meeting held 31 May 1995	20
Minutes of Meeting held 6 June 1995	21
Minutes of Meeting held 7 June 1995	22

REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

- 1 Estimates Committee A presents this Report to the Legislative Assembly in relation to the estimates of expenditure for:

The Office of the Governor
Queensland Audit Office
Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations
Department of the Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development
Treasury Department
Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

Introduction

- 2 The Legislative Assembly on 31 March 1995 appointed six Estimates Committees to inquire into the estimates of expenditure contained in the *Appropriation (Parliament) Bill 1995* and the *Appropriation Bill 1995*.

- 3 This Committee, under the Sessional Orders adopted by the House, has had the following organisational units allocated to it:

Office of the Governor
Legislative Assembly (Parliamentary Service Commission)
Queensland Audit Office
Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations
other organisational units within the portfolio of the Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development
other organisational units within the portfolio of the Treasurer
other organisational units within the portfolio of the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Planning

- 4 The Sessional Orders also require that Estimates Committee A present two Reports, that is, one for the Legislative Assembly and another for the Office of the Governor, the Queensland Audit Office, the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations, and other organisational units within the portfolio of the Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development, organisational units within the portfolio of the Treasurer and organisational units within the portfolio of the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Planning. The Committee is reporting separately in relation to the Legislative Assembly.

- 5 Estimates Committee A has now considered those estimates referred to it other than the Legislative Assembly (Parliamentary Service Commission) and has met in public session

to receive evidence from Ministers and supporting officers. Additional information, which has been received as a result of questions asked during the public session, will be presented to the House in an additional volume of information.

Estimates for the Office of the Governor

- 6 The Committee notes that the recommendations arising from the review of the administration of Government House are nearing full implementation. The process has included an independent insurance risk assessment and, for the first time, expenditure at Government House is now subject to annual audits.

Estimates for the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations

- 7 The Committee was informed of the ongoing increase in public demand for the assistance of the Parliamentary Commissioner. An additional two temporary officers are to be employed in the coming financial year to help address the backlog of cases in the Office of the Parliamentary Commissioner which had risen, as at 28 February 1995, to 1,546.
- 8 The Committee recognises the continued emphasis which the Ombudsman is placing on servicing the rural community.

Estimates for the Queensland Audit Office

- 9 The Committee notes that overall demand for the services of the Queensland Audit Office has increased, with increased workload arising from the continuing corporatisation process and additional auditing required by statutes. The 1995-96 budget allocation to the Office is more than double the level of allocation in 1989-90. At the same time, about 86% of the total cost of the QAO is now offset by audit fee receipts levied in accordance with the Government's user-pays policy.
- 10 In 1995-96, the Office will replace its computerised audit management system which will enable better job costing. Other developments in information technology, including enhanced office automation facilities, should also lead to increased efficiency and reduced operating costs.

Estimates for the Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development

- 11 During the course of its questioning, the Committee was assured that the working structure of the Office of the Cabinet, despite having six separate policy units, was such that it enhanced the co-ordination of policy across government. The Committee acknowledges the recent achievements of the Office of the Cabinet in improving the competitiveness of Queensland business; in beneficially negotiating Queensland's position with regards to national competition policy; and in helping secure increased levels of university places for Queensland students.
- 12 In response to questions relating to the effectiveness of the Co-ordinator General, the Committee was informed of the Co-ordinator General's role in developing projects such

- as the Carpentaria/Mount Isa Mineral Province, the Cape York Peninsula land use study, continued developments at South Bank and the supply of natural gas from the South West Queensland gas fields.
- 13 In relation to the Trade and Investment Development Division (TIDD), the Committee notes that a November 1994 survey by a national accounting firm showed that the TIDD had assisted in achieving \$88 million in export sales, with an additional \$162 million under negotiation as at 30 June 1994. The Committee notes the continued growth in Queensland exports, particularly to markets in Japan, Korea, Hong Kong and Indonesia. The Committee accepts TIDD's promotion of Queensland's food products and its involvement in the Queensland export awards as being essential.
- 14 The Committee also asked questions about the proposed expenditure of \$1.2 million in 1995-96 for the Women's Policy Unit. The Committee was assured that the public's level of contact with the Women's Infolink service was greater than ever and that the Unit had had a successful role in co-ordinating International Women's Day events across the whole of Queensland. The Committee was told of the increasing number of women in positions in the public service, in particular on the membership of Boards and Trusts.
- 15 The Committee acknowledges the recent review of the Public Sector Management Commission (PSMC) and believes the Commission should continue to have an important role to play in the public administration of the State. The Premier supplied additional information regarding staffing levels and remuneration in response to questions involving the PSMC, the Premier's personal office, the Office of the Director-General and the Offices of the Deputy Directors-General.
- 16 The Committee notes that the Department has also established a Stress Policy Unit and is looking to introduce a Code of Conduct in response to the passing of the *Public Sector Ethics Act*. The Committee supports the PSMC's initiatives regarding the employment of people with disabilities and the Department's policy of cutting its electricity consumption. The Committee further acknowledges the enhanced electronic access to legislation provided by Queensland Legislative Services and the role of the Information Policy Board in reducing the costs of the Government's telecommunications needs, with savings in this area estimated at \$18 million in 1994-95.

Estimates for the Treasury Department

- 17 The Committee's examination of the estimates of expenditure for the Treasury Department were impacted on by substantial changes in the program structure of the department over the last twelve months. It was explained to the Committee that, while estimated actual expenditure figures for financial year 1994-95 had been included on the basis of the current program structure, no useful purpose would be served in attempting to compare these estimates with expenditure reported for 1993-94 on the Budget Papers for 1994-95 as these were prepared on a totally different basis. The Treasurer also informed the Committee that the new program structures evolved out of a strategic review which produced the Department's new strategic plan. In essence, this resulted in separate programs for taxation and gaming, the incorporation of fiscal and financial management functions into one program, and the placing of technical support systems and specialist areas in one program.

- 18 The Committee sought details of Queensland's budgetary surplus and, in particular, the position that Queensland would be in if \$1 billion of debt had not been paid off to the Commonwealth some ten years early. In response, it was stated that the payment of that amount made no difference to the State's net debt position. Rather, it only affected the State's net financing requirement (NFR). It was also stated that the forecast NFR has always been less than the actual amount required because of carry-overs from one year to the next.
- 19 Several questions were raised by the Committee about the Crime Statistics Unit within the Government Statistician's Office. The Committee was told that the unit had been established to provide proper criminal justice statistics which, with the level of expertise of the Statistician's Office, could be gathered in an objective manner and which would contribute to better policy making. The cost of the office is some \$305,000 for 1995-96 and it will employ six staff who will be involved in a range of surveys for other agencies of the Government. As the Office increasingly operates on a commercial basis, much of this work will be done on a contract basis. In response to questions concerning possible political polling by the Office, the Committee was assured that it would not be asked to carry out such polling.
- 20 The Committee sought explanation of the nil expenditure proposed for 1995-96 for the Motor Vehicle Insurance Nominal Defendant Fund. This matter was raised because of the estimated actual expenditure of \$154.7 million for it in the 1994-95 financial year. The reason lies in the funds rationalisation which has been carried out. The original Motor Vehicles Insurance Nominal Defendant Fund was closed down and two new funds established to replace it. The large expenditure in 1994-95 was, in fact, the transfer of the existing balance to the two new funds. Similarly, the large decrease in expected expenditure in 1995-96 from the Motor Accident Insurance Fund was a result of transfers made in the previous year.
- 21 The Committee sought details on the levels of assistance being given to local government to upgrade sewage treatment plants. While there is \$2.5 million allocated for 1995-96, consultations are being held with local government to ensure that funds are properly targeted and the Committee was told an announcement on this is expected shortly.
- 22 An explanation was sought of the activities of the Office of State Revenue which is expected to raise some \$56 million in assessments and debt collections in 1995-96. The approach taken by that office is that each year it prepares a compliance plan which includes an audit program and it decides on a set of taxpayers or industry to examine. The subsequent audits and publicity they receive leads to considerable extra revenue for the Government. As at 31 March 1995, the unit had collected an additional \$30.75 million and some \$36 million was outstanding, pending legal advice.
- 23 In relation to the Queensland Infrastructure Financing Fund (QIFF), questions were asked concerning the level of funds available and their possible use. The present balance of the fund is some \$295 million which comprises \$188 million from the sale of Queensland Nickel and \$107 million from giving a commercial debt structure to Q-Fleet. For 1995-96, further payments into the fund of approximately \$121 million are anticipated. The Committee was told that, while it is difficult to estimate exactly how much expenditure will be committed, projects will include the South Coast Motorway, the Ernest Henry pipeline, the dams on the Comet and Dawson Rivers, and the pipeline

to the Eungella Dam through the central Queensland coalfields. It was also explained to the Committee that QIFF is an innovative mechanism to bring a range of projects on line earlier than would otherwise be the case.

- 24 The Committee also queried the method of operation of the tax equivalent regime being implemented for government owned corporations. It was advised that this development flowed from the 1993 Premiers' Conference at which agreement was reached that all states would participate as part of the microeconomic reforms being undertaken Australia-wide. The alternative to such bodies being charged a state enterprises tax is that they pay tax to the Commonwealth.
- 25 The Committee also sought an assurance that the use of derivatives in the management of the State's debt was protected by sufficient safeguards to ensure that the Orange County and Barings Bank experiences would not be repeated in Queensland. In reply, the Committee was told that the enterprises which use derivatives are the QTC, the QIC, the QIDC and Suncorp. In respect of all of these there are comprehensive policy guidelines in place and, in respect of QTC, a strict separation between dealers and those involved with settlement. It was also important to note that external parties were also aware of the policies of the QTC and would not accept transactions outside of those policies without first obtaining verification from senior management.
- 26 In relation to the operation of the QIDC, information was sought as to the dividend expected in 1995-96 and the range of the capital adequacy ratio over the previous two years. The Committee was told that traditionally, over recent years, the QIDC has paid 40% of its after tax profit as a dividend and that has been of the order of \$10 million. The dividend to be paid in 1996-96 would, similarly, be dependent on the QIDC's profit performance for the year. In relation to capital adequacy the current ratio is 11% and, generally, the QIDC has exceeded the 8% basis ratio.

Estimates for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

- 27 The Committee notes that, while the total supply of public rental housing has increased by 50.7% between 1989 and 1994, there has also been an increase in the number of people on the waiting list to a current level of about 27,000. It is expected that an additional 10,000 families will be assisted through public housing this year. Total housing stock should rise to around 45,900 dwellings, with an additional 1,750 dwellings having been constructed or acquired.
- 28 The Committee was told that proposed expenditure of \$8.2 million in 1995-96 will be spent on securing accommodation for people leaving institutions such as long-stay psychiatric hospitals. The Committee notes the proposed provision in the coming year of 500 places for women escaping domestic violence and considers as innovative the plan to purchase additional boarding houses in Cairns, Townsville and inner Brisbane in response to the fact that such properties are becoming more scarce due to their increasing attractiveness to private purchasers.
- 29 The Committee also notes the shift of staffing priorities within the Department. A substantial staff increase of 78 in the public rental sub-program includes the transfer of some eight positions from community housing, 20 from home ownership, and 25 from private rental.

- 30 The Committee sought information regarding the fact that 1994-95 estimated actual for the HOME Shared Trust Fund is \$105 million above the estimated 1994-95 figure. Evidence was provided that the surplus in the HOME Purchase Assistance Account had been used to buy back from the Queensland Treasury Corporation \$105 million worth of debt in the Rental Purchase Plan. The Committee also notes that in the five years to 30 June 1995, it is estimated that credit in the Purchase Assistance Account will have risen almost \$85 million to \$280 million.
- 31 The Committee also acknowledges that, from time to time, properties are disposed of for amounts insufficient to fully redeem the loans taken out by the Department's clients.
- 32 In relation to Local Government, the Committee observes that some \$13 million allocated in capital grants in 1994-95 remains unexpended. In response to questions relating to the Hilmer Report, the Committee was assured that the principles of the National Competition Policy should result in increased efficiency and savings relating to all Councils' operations and that there would be no requirement for Councils to increase charges.
- 33 Responsibility for the Office of Rural Communities was transferred to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning on 16 December 1994. The Committee notes the supporting role which the Office of Rural Communities has provided to the Rural Communities Cabinet Committee. The Committee also notes that the results of a study supported by the Office of Rural Communities into how government services are delivered to the rural and remote parts of the State are planned to be incorporated into the strategic and program plans of various departments in the near future.

The Estimates Committee Procedure

- 34 This Committee makes comments in its Report No. 1 in relation to areas which could be the subject of review to refine the Estimates Committee process.

Conclusion

- 35 The Committee appreciates the co-operation afforded to it by all Ministers and their departmental officers. The Committee congratulates these officials on their preparedness and willingness to properly fulfil their accountability responsibilities.
- 36 The Committee has agreed to the proposed expenditures referred to it, without amendment.

Recommendation

- 37 The Committee recommends that the proposed expenditure be agreed to.



Mr Tom Barton MLA
Chairman

STATEMENT OF RESERVATIONS BY MINORITY



Estimates Committee A - Reservation Statement

Premier, Economic and Trade Development

- 1 The budgetary impact of the massive increase in stress claims is noted. In particular we note that the number of stress related claims increased in the 1989-90 financial years from 84 to 722 with a consequent increase in costs from \$726,000 to over \$6 million.

We are concerned that much of this increase can be attributed to structural changes to the public sector initiated by the Department's Public Sector Management Commission.
- 2 In general terms the non-Government Members of the Committee remain unimpressed with the performance of the PSMC and its contribution to public sector inefficiency.
- 3 Reservations are also expressed about the "re-appointment" of former Cabinet Office Director-General and now ALP Federal candidate, Kevin Rudd, to the position of Director of the Policy and Planning Unit. Non-Government Members note that despite indications from both Mr Rudd and the Premier of a substantial and appropriate drop in salary and conditions, there has been only a minimal downgrading in entitlements.
- 4 Non-Government Members are not convinced that having six separate units in the Cabinet Office assists, rather than hinders, policy co-ordination and implementation.
- 5 It is noted that there are 50 appeals remaining outstanding through the Public Sector Management Commission.
- 6 Non-Government Members note that the Premier was unable to provide the Committee with specific details of tourist infrastructure, in particular bed numbers, facilitated by the Officer of Co-ordinator General.

Treasury Department

- 7 Of serious concern from the question of the Treasurer was the establishment of the Crime Statistics Unit and the associated polling facilities in that unit. We were extremely concerned that this unit could be used for political purposes by the Government and the answers by the Treasurer did not allay these fears.
- 8 Non-Government Members of the Committee were also very concerned that the Treasurer was unable to admit that he had made changes to the budget papers in regard to charts which appeared in the 1994-95 budget papers and the 1995-96 budget papers. These changes to the indices on these two graphs were used to paint a better picture for the Treasurer, and this was largely confirmed by the Under-Treasurer.
- 9 Non-Government Members noted the advice to the Committee by the Treasurer that while estimated actual expenditure figures for financial year 1994-95 had been included on the basis of the current program structure, there was no useful purpose in attempting to compare these estimates with expenditure reported for 1994-95 on the Budget papers for 1994-95 as these were prepared on a totally different basis.

Non-Government Members express concern that such a change in the format presents major difficulties for the Estimates Committee to effectively discharge their role.

- 10 The non-Government Members of the Committee also were interested in the 72 per cent blow-out in the cost of consultancies to the Treasury Department in 1994-95 compared to his estimates in last year's estimates committees. Non-Government Members were also very concerned that the Treasurer indicated that consultancy fees to Treasury would continue to rise.

Housing, Local Government and Planning and Office of Rural Communities

Role Duplication

- 11 One of the principal roles of the Office of Rural Communities, as outlined in the Portfolio Program Statement is to "co-ordinate, organise and promote" the Rural Communities Cabinet Committee.
- 12 Given the vast resources at the disposal of the Office of Cabinet, the non-Government Members have considerable reservations about the duplication of the roles of the ORC and the Office of the Cabinet, in this respect.
- 13 Indeed, the Minister admitted that of the three Rural Communities Cabinet Committee meetings held during the year, the Office of the Cabinet took over the job of organising the deputations at the Minister's request "because of the experience that it has in running deputations".

Rural Impact Statements

- 14 The ORC is charged with ensuring that a rural perspective is maintained through the decision making process, specifically through the preparation of Rural Impact Statements.

- 15 In this light, non-Government Members are critical of the failure to disclose the number (as opposed to the content) of RIS submitted by the office in the course of the last financial year.
- 16 Similarly, the issue of tree clearing guidelines has been one of principal concern to rural communities in recent months. As the lead agency representing the interests of rural communities, the Opposition is again concerned at the failure to disclose whether representations supporting rural communities were made by the ORC on tree clearing.
- 17 As answers to these questions were not supplied to the Committee, it is impossible to ascertain or quantify the effectiveness of the ORC in representing rural Queenslanders.

Service Provision

- 18 The CountryNet program within the ORC is the only section of the ORC providing direct service through its management of QGAP, QDIAL and the Bush Telegraph. The Minister outlined that \$25,585 was attributable to the production and distribution of the Bush Telegraph, while \$600,000 and \$900,000 was allocated to QGAP and QDIAL respectively, making a total of \$1,525,585 against an estimated actual of \$1,912,000. The difference of \$386,415 would appear excessive given that only five staff run the CountryNet service.

HOME

- 19 As a result of time constraints facing the Committee, a number of matters require further and closer scrutiny.
- 20 One issue of concern to non-Government Members is the financial accountability of the co-operative housing program. With a 1000% increase in the allocation of public funds in this area, we believe the audited financial reports should be made public.
- 21 Non-Government Members are aware of the growing concern about the number of people in the Government's Rental Purchase program who have little or no chance of ever owning their own homes. Many people in the Rental Purchase Scheme are already in arrears and with many of these purchasers having a debt greater than the value of their home.
- 22 Under "Assistance to Private Renters", reference is made to bond loans to 24,000 renters, however on the figures supplied 8,500 people will not repay the loan which will cost the taxpayers \$5 million in the coming year. This appears to non-Government Members to be an unacceptable level.

The Estimates Process

- 23 We remain deeply concerned that a proposed review of the estimates process - to be undertaken by the Parliament itself - was overlooked in preference to a review undertaken by the Office of Cabinet. Non-Government Members of this Committee believe that a complete review of the estimates process should be undertaken at the completion of the consideration of this year's appropriation and that this review should be conducted by the Parliament and its officers.

- 24 The Estimates Committee process has been significantly flawed and has failed to provide the accountable and open process promised when the committees were originally established last year. While we strongly support the concept of the estimate committee process, we are again disappointed that Committee A failed to live up to our expectations of what that committee should achieve.
- 25 As pointed out in a letter to the Speaker on 25 May 1995, there are several areas where the Committee could be improved to provide a genuine accountability for the budget process. These include the ability to ask questions on revenue required to fund the proposed expenditure; the ability to ask questions on government owned corporations and that independent entities be allowed to appear on their own behalf.
- 26 For the estimates committee process to be truly effective, more time must also be provided between the bringing down of the Budget and the sitting of Estimate Committee A to allow Committee Members proper time to scrutinise the Budget prior to questioning of the Treasurer. It is our strong belief that the current system barely pays lip service to proper accountability in the budget process, and the Queensland Parliament would be better to model its system on the Senate system in Canberra.
- 27 Other problems during this year's Estimate Committee A included: the use of answers by the Minister to launch attacks, during the Government Members' question time, on the Coalition Members of the Committee, which the Members are unable to answer and the refusal by Ministers to take questions on notice if it does not suit them. There must be a capability for Committee Members to demand answers in writing if the Ministers are unable to answer. The refusal by Ministers to provide associated documentary evidence when requested to support answers to Committee Members' questions. Ministers answering questions on so-called "taboo" subjects like debt and revenue when they want, as in answer to questions from Labour Members of the Committee, but refusing to answer similar questions from Opposition Members. More comprehensive guidelines are also required to ensure that rulings from the Chairman are consistent.

Rob Borbidge

Rob Borbidge, MLA

Joan Sheldon

Joan Sheldon, MLA

Di McCauley

Di McCauley, MLA

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Minutes of Meeting held 22 May 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

**Minutes of the Meeting held on 22 May 1995
at 7.10 pm in Room B.27
Parliament House, Brisbane**

1. **Present:**

Mr T Barton MLA
Mr R Borbidge MLA
Mr J Budd MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
Mrs D McCauley MLA
Mr W Nunn MLA
Mrs J Sheldon MLA

In Attendance:

Mr D Martin, Research Director
Mr D Thannhauser, Senior Research Officer

2. **Appointment of Committee**

The Research Director referred to the Sessional Orders of 31 March 1995 appointing Estimates Committees and announced that, pursuant to a resolution of the House of 31 March, the above listed Members were appointed Members of Estimates Committee A.

3. **Election of Chairman**

By leave of the Committee, the Research Director proceeded to the election of the Chairman.

Mr Barton was nominated by Mr Davies and seconded by Mr Budd.

And there being no further nominations, Mr Barton was declared elected and took the Chair.

4. **Election of Deputy Chairman**

The Chairman called for nominations for the position of Deputy Chairman.

Mr Borbidge, by leave, made a statement indicating that no Member of the Opposition would contest the position.

Mr Budd was nominated by Mr Davies and seconded by Mr Nunn.

And there being no further nominations, Mr Budd was declared elected.

5. Allocation of Times for Departments

The Chairman circulated a list of possible time allocations for Departments for consideration by Members of the Committee.

After discussion it was agreed that the following allocation and timetable would be adopted for the hearing to be held on 30 May 1995:

Speaker	1 hour	11.30 am - 12.30 pm
Lunch		12.30 - 2.00 pm
Premier - Agencies		
Governor	10 mins	2.00 - 2.10 pm
Ombudsman	20 mins	2.10 - 2.30 pm
Auditor General	30 mins	2.30 - 3.00 pm
Premier - Department	2 hours, 30 minutes	3.00 - 5.30 pm
Treasurer	1 hour, 20 minutes	5.40 - 7.00 pm
Evening Meal		7.00 - 8.00 pm
Treasurer	1 hour, 10 minutes	8.00 - 9.10 pm
Housing & Local Government	2 hours, 30 minutes	9.10 - 11.40 pm

6. General Business

The Committee agreed, after discussion, that:

- (i) It would be appropriate for Government and non-Government Members to sit as two separate groups;
- (ii) Answers to questions taken on notice be required to be forwarded to the Committee by 5.00 pm on Friday 2 June, unless otherwise ordered;
- (iii) No "at Table" briefings by Members' staffs take place;
- (iv) In accordance with Sessional Orders, leave be given to non-Committee Members to ask questions during the hearing;
- (v) In accordance with paragraph 9 of the Procedures to be Observed by Assembly Committees regarding Witnesses, any deliberation on Chairman's rulings be conducted in private;

- (vi) If the time allocation for a Department is not substantially filled during the hearing, the Committee suspend until the starting time for the next period;
- (vii) Members to notify either the Research Director or Senior Research Officer as to what further briefing material is required from Departments, and
- (viii) Ministers be permitted to make a short introductory statement.

The Committee also discussed the method of calculation of time periods, the need for clearly seen time clocks and the scope of questioning to be allowed.

6. Time and Date of Next Meeting

The Committee agreed that it would next meet in Room B.27 at Parliament House on 29 May 1995 at 5.30 pm.

7. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 7.52 pm.

Confirmed this twenty-ninth day of May 1995,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. B. ...', is written over a long horizontal line that spans across the page.

CHAIRMAN

Minutes of Meeting held 29 May 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

**Minutes of the Meeting held on 29 May 1995
at 5.50 pm in Room B.27
Parliament House, Brisbane**

1. **Present:** Mr T Barton MLA
Mr J Budd MLA
Mr W Nunn MLA
Mrs J Sheldon MLA
- In Attendance:** Mr D Martin, Research Director
Mr D Thannhauser, Senior Research Officer
- Apologies:** Mr R Borbidge MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
Mrs D McCauley MLA

2. **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

On the motion of Mr Budd, seconded by Mr Nunn, the Minutes of the Meeting held on 22 May 1995 were confirmed.

3. **Arrangements for Public Hearing**

The Committee discussed arrangements for the public hearing to be held on 30 May 1995.

4. **Time and Date of Next Meeting**

The Committee agreed that, following the public hearing on 30 May 1995 at 11.30 a.m., it would meet on 31 May 1995 at 12 noon in Room 6.45 of the Parliamentary Annexe.

5. **Adjournment**

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 7.10 pm.

Confirmed this thirty - first day of May 1995,



CHAIRMAN

Minutes of Proceedings held 30 May 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

**Minutes of Hearings of Estimates Committee A
held at 11.30 am on 30 May 1995 in
the Legislative Council Chamber
Parliament House, Brisbane**

1. MEETING

The Committee met in public session at 11.30 am.

The following Members of the Committee were present:

Mr T Barton MLA
Mr R Borbidge MLA
Mr J Budd MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
Mrs D McCauley MLA
Mr W Nunn MLA
Mrs J Sheldon MLA

The Chairman, Mr Tom Barton, took the Chair.

2. STATEMENT BY THE CHAIRMAN

The Chairman made an introductory statement concerning the Committee's consideration of proposed expenditure contained in the *Appropriation (Parliament) Bill 1995* and the *Appropriation Bill 1995* for the areas set out in the Sessional Orders.

3. EXAMINATION OF ESTIMATES

Parliamentary Service Commission

In attendance was the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, the Honourable Jim Fouras MLA, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr R D Doyle	Clerk of the Parliament
Ms M Cornwell	Deputy Clerk of the Parliament
Mr R Fick	Manager, Corporate Services
Mr M Hickey	Manager, Finance

The Committee examined the witnesses.

Mr A Fitzgerald MLA, by leave, also asked questions:

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 12.31 pm.

Resumption of Sitting

The Committee resumed at 2.00 pm.

Office of the Governor

In attendance was the Honourable W K Goss MLA, Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr J O'Connor	Official Secretary
Mr E Bigby	Executive Director, Government and Corporate Services
Mr L Harris	Acting Director-General
Mr T Leighton	Director, Financial Services

The Committee examined the witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and Mr J O'Connor withdrew.

Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations

Mr F King, Deputy Parliamentary Commissioner, and Mr M Schafer, Director, Organisational Services, Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations, attended.

The Committee examined the witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and Mr King and Mr Schafer withdrew.

Queensland Audit Office

Mr B Rollason, Auditor-General, Mr A Skippington, Assistant Auditor-General, and Mr G Davis, Manager, Financial Services, attended.

The Committee examined the witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and Mr Rollason, Mr Skippington and Mr Davis withdrew.

Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development

The following officers attended:

Office of the Cabinet

Dr G Davis

Director-General

Public Sector Management Commission

Dr B Head

Chair

The Committee examined the witness.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 5.10 pm.

Resumption of Sitting

The Committee resumed at 5.40 pm.

Treasury Department

In attendance was the Treasurer, the Honourable K E De Lacy MLA, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr G Bradley

Under Treasurer

Mr M Gray

Deputy Under Treasurer

Mr G Poole

Assistant Under Treasurer
(Office of the Under Treasurer)

Mr M Lawrence

Assistant Under Treasurer
(Corporate Services)

Ms J Macdonnell

Executive Director (Office of State Revenue)

Mr S Rochester

Chief Executive Officer (Qld Treasury Corporation)

Mr D Balwin

Acting Director, Financial Services Branch

The Committee examined the witnesses.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 7.00 pm.

Resumption of Sitting

The Committee resumed at 8.00 pm.

The Committee continued its examination of witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

In attendance was the Honourable T Mackenroth MLA, Minister for Housing, Local Government and Planning, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr K Smith	Director General
Housing Services	
Mr T Waters	Acting General Manager, Housing Services
Mr A Ackfun	Manager, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Housing Division
Mr P Edmonds	Acting Manager, Home Ownership Division
Ms J Clark	Acting Manager, Rental & Community Housing Division
Housing Production Services	
Mr T Cripps	Acting General Manager, Housing Production Services
Mr F Turvey	Manager, Production Management Division
Planning Services	
Mr K Yearbury	General Manager, Planning Services
Mr W Rowe	Manager, Planning Policy and Information Division
Local Government Services	
Mr M Tucker	General Manager, Local Government Services
Mr P Woolley	Manager, Local Government Finance Division
Financial Services	
Mr I Fulton	General Manager, Financial Services
Mr C Callioni	Manager, Financial Policy and Management Division
Ms J Parker	Manager, Financial Accounting & Reporting Division
Organisational Services	
Mr B Hunt	General Manager, Organisational Services
Ms J Phillips	Acting Manager, Information Services Division
Executive Services	
Ms L Apelt	Director, Executive Services
Mr A McKinnon	Manager, Queensland Bureau of Animal Welfare
Mr C Matheson	Acting Manager, Cabinet Legislation & Liaison Unit

Office of Rural Communities

Ms E Fraser

Principal Policy Officer

The Committee examined the witnesses.

Mr J Goss MLA, Mr K R Lingard MLA, and Miss F Simpson MLA, by leave, also asked questions.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

4. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee adjourned at 11.31 pm.

Confirmed this 31st Day of May 1995



CHAIRMAN

Minutes of Meeting held 31 May 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

Minutes of the Meeting held on 31 May 1995
at 12 noon in Room 6.45
Level 6, Parliamentary Annexe, Brisbane

1. **Present:** Mr T Barton MLA
Mr R Borbidge MLA
Mr J Budd MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
- In Attendance:** Mr D Martin, Research Director
Mr D Thannhauser, Senior Research Officer
- Apologies:** Mrs D McCauley MLA
Mr W Nunn MLA
Mrs J Sheldon MLA

2. **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

On the motion of Mr Budd, seconded by Mr Davies, the Minutes of the Meetings held on 22 May and 30 May 1995 were confirmed.

3. **Discussion of Outcomes of Public Hearing**

The Committee discussed the public hearing held on 30 May 1995 and matters appropriate to be included in its Reports to the Assembly.

4. **Time and Date of Future Meetings**

The Committee agreed that it would meet on 6 June 1995 at 11.30 am in Room A.35 and on 7 June 1995 at 11.30 am in Room A.17.

5. **Adjournment**

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 12.22 pm.

Confirmed this sixth day of June 1995,



CHAIRMAN

Minutes of Meeting held 6 June 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

**Minutes of the Meeting held on 6 June 1995
at 11.35 am in Room A.35
Parliament House, Brisbane**

1. **Present:** Mr T Barton MLA
Mr R Borbidge MLA
Mr J Budd MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
Mrs D McCauley MLA
Mrs J Sheldon MLA
- In Attendance:** Mr D Martin, Research Director
Mr D Thannhauser, Senior Research Officer
- Apologies:** Mr W Nunn MLA
2. **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting**
- On the motion of Mr Davies, seconded by Mr Borbidge, the Minutes of the Meeting held on 31 May 1995 were confirmed.
3. **Receipt of Answers to Questions on Notice**
- The Committee noted the responses to questions taken on notice at the Public Hearing held on 30 May 1995.
4. **Circulation of Chairman's Draft Reports**
- Copies of the Chairman's Draft Reports Nos 1 and 2 were circulated to Members.
5. **Time and Date of Next Meeting**
- The Committee confirmed that it would next meet on 7 June 1995 at 11.30 am in Room A.17, Parliament House.
5. **Adjournment**
- There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 11.45 am.

Confirmed this seventh day of June 1995,



CHAIRMAN

Minutes of Meeting held 7 June 1995

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

**Minutes of the Meeting held on Wednesday 7 June 1995
at 11.30 am in Room A.35
Parliament House, Brisbane**

At 11.30 am:

Present: Mr T Barton MLA
Mr J Budd MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
Mr W Nunn MLA

In Attendance: Mr D Martin, Research Director
Mr D Thannhauser, Senior Research Officer

And 30 minutes having elapsed and a quorum not being present,
at 12 noon the Chairman suspended the meeting until 3.30 pm.

At 3.30 pm:

1. **Present:** Mr T Barton MLA
Mr R Borbidge MLA
Mr K Davies MLA
Mr W Nunn MLA
Mrs J Sheldon

In Attendance: Mr D Martin, Research Director
Mr D Thannhauser, Senior Research Officer

Apologies: Mr J Budd
Mrs D McCauley

2. **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

On the motion of Mr Davies, seconded by Mrs Sheldon, the Minutes of the Meeting held on Tuesday 6 June were confirmed.

3. Correspondence

On the motion of Mr Davies, seconded by Mrs Sheldon, inwards correspondence was received and outwards correspondence confirmed.

4. Authorisation of Publication

On the motion of Mrs Sheldon, seconded by Mr Davies, it was resolved:

That the Committee authorises the publication of all documents presented to it in the course of its hearings and authorises publication of written replies and other documents forwarded to it.

5. Consideration of Chairman's Draft Reports

The Committee proceeded to the consideration of the Chairman's Draft Reports Nos. 1 and 2 in relation to estimates of expenditure referred to the Committee pursuant to Sessional Orders.

On the motion of Mr Davies, seconded by Mr Nunn, it was resolved:

That, in relation to the Legislative Assembly, the proposed expenditures be agreed to and that the Chairman's Draft Report No. 1, as amended, be adopted as the Report of the Committee and be tabled by the Chairman on 13 June 1995, together with supplementary material.

On the motion of Mr Davies, seconded by Mr Nunn, it was resolved:

That, in relation to the Office of the Governor, Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations, Queensland Audit Office, Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development, Treasury Department and Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning and Office of Rural Communities, the proposed expenditures be agreed to and that the Chairman's Draft Report No. 2, as amended, be adopted as the Report of the Committee and be tabled by the Chairman on 13 June 1995 together with supplementary material.

Mr Borbidge and Mrs Sheldon indicated on behalf of Opposition Members that a Statement of Reservations would be attached to Report No. 2.

6. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 3.50 pm.

Certified correct this eighth day of June 1995



CHAIRMAN