

## **ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A**

## **REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF QUEENSLAND**

Office of the Governor Queensland Audit Office Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development Treasury Department Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

Estimates Committee A Report No. 2 23 June 1994

## **ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A**

#### CHAIRPERSON:

Mr Tom Barton MLA (Member for Waterford)

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON:

Mr John Budd MLA (Member for Redlands)

**MEMBERS**:

Mr Rob Borbidge MLA (Member for Surfers Paradise)

Mr Ken Davies MLA (Member for Mundingburra)

Mrs Di McCauley MLA (Member for Callide)

Mr Bill Nunn MLA (Member for Hervey Bay)

Mrs Joan Sheldon MLA (Member for Caloundra)

#### **RESEARCH DIRECTOR:**

Mr Darrell Martin

SENIOR RESEARCH OFFICER:

Mr Ross Mensforth

.



THE CLICK OF THE PARLIAMENT

## ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

## REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF QUEENSLAND

23 June 1994

## CONTENTS

## Page

ſ

REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY	1
Introduction	1
Estimates for the Office of the Governor	2
Estimates for the Queensland Audit Office	2
Estimates for the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative	
Investigations	3
Estimates for the Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade	
Development	4
Estimates for the Treasury Department	5
Estimates for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning	6
The Estimates Committee Procedure	7
Conclusion	8
Recommendation	8
STATEMENT OF RESERVATIONS BY MINORITY	9
MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS	13
Minutes of Meeting held 30 May 1994	13
Minutes of Meeting held 7 June 1994	15
Minutes of Proceedings held 9 June 1994	17
Minutes of Meeting held 10 June 1994	24
Minutes of Meeting held 16 June 1994	26
Minutes of Meeting held 17 June 1994	28

## **REPORT TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**

1 Estimates Committee A presents this Report to the Legislative Assembly in relation to the estimates of expenditure for:

The Office of the Governor

Queensland Audit Office

Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations

Department of the Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development

Treasury Department

Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

## Introduction

- 2 The Legislative Assembly on 28 April 1994 appointed six Estimates Committees to inquire into the estimates of expenditure contained in the Appropriation Bill 1994 and the Appropriation (Parliament) Bill 1994.
- 3 This Committee, under the Sessional Orders adopted by the House, has had the following organisational units allocated to it:

Office of the Governor

Legislative Assembly (Parliamentary Service Commission)

Queensland Audit Office

Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations

other organisational units within the portfolio of the Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development

other organisational units within the portfolio of the Treasurer

other organisational units within the portfolio of the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Planning

- 4 The Sessional Orders also require that Estimates Committee A present two Reports, that is, one for the Legislative Assembly and another for the Office of the Governor, the Queensland Audit Office, the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations, and other organisational units within the portfolio of the Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development, organisational units within the portfolio of the Treasurer and organisational units within the portfolio of the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Planning. The Committee is reporting separately in relation to the Legislative Assembly.
- 5 Estimates Committee A has now considered those estimates referred to it other than the Legislative Assembly (Parliamentary Service Commission) and has met in public session to receive evidence from Ministers and supporting officers. Additional information, which has been received as a result of questions asked during the public session, will be presented to the House in an additional volume of information.

## Estimates for the Office of the Governor

6 The Committee notes that a review of the administration of Government House has been undertaken and that officers from the Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development had provided assistance in undertaking the review. It resulted in some 22 recommendations aimed at achieving a higher level of accountability and a refinement of operations.

## Estimates for the Queensland Audit Office

- 7 The Committee notes that bipartisan support exists for the current reforms being undertaken by the Queensland Audit Office.
- 8 In relation to auditing costs, the Committee is aware of a move to user pays charges for auditing. The Committee acknowledges that the ideal situation would be that ultimately the Audit Office would be self-funding. However, it should be realised that ultimately the funds still derive principally from consolidated revenue and that the main purpose behind such a move is to make the real costs of such activities more transparent.
- 9 Other changes have also occurred in the Audit Office. As a result of the Electoral and Administrative Review Commission's review the Auditor General is introducing a flatter management structure and a specialist corporate services function aimed at improving the overall performance and administration of the Office. In addition, the Committee was informed that changes to the staffing structure had occurred and that, before the recent addition of 21 positions, there had only been a 4.5 percent growth in staff numbers since 1978.

- 10 The Committee also received evidence which indicated the on-going commitment of the Auditor General's Office to improving and enhancing its function. This, in part, comes from the development and implementation of quality assurance processes, together with future peer reviews.
- 11 In relation to the extent of compliance with the Treasurer's guidelines in regard to disclosure requirements, it was noted that levels of compliance had fallen. The Committee was advised that the Audit Office would continue to monitor departments' audit-related activities and prepare an appropriate report to Parliament if necessary.

## Estimates for the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations

- 12 The Committee recognises the important role played by the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations (Ombudsman) in providing the people of Queensland with an appropriate avenue of recourse against certain public sector actions.
- 13 The Committee heard evidence that the number of official complaints being received by the Ombudsman has been increasing and sought information in relation to steps being taken to cater for the increase. The Committee was informed that there had been a 40 percent increase in staff of the Ombudsman since 1991/92 and that additional funds had recently been provided for the employment of two extra investigators. Further assistance is also being provided through the installation of new information technology and it is anticipated that the caseload of individual investigators will substantially reduce.
- 14 The Committee also received evidence in relation to the future role of the Ombudsman and his oversight of corporatised entities. The Committee notes that this is a matter of policy and offers no opinion on its merits.

## Estimates for the Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development

- 15 The Committee queried the fact that the budget for the Department was considerably larger than it was in 1989 and sought information on how Queensland tax payers were receiving value for money from this increase. The Committee accepts that departmental structures are now substantially different from what they were in 1989, with the total number of departments being reduced from 27 to 18. These changes, together with changes in the focus and responsibilities of various programs, makes comparison difficult.
- 16 In relation to the Office of the Parliamentary Counsel, the Committee sought details of workload being experienced. It was informed that in 1992, 68 bills and 463 pieces of subordinate legislation resulted in a total of 5,500 pages of legislation. In 1993, it dealt with 85 bills and 521 pieces of subordinate legislation for a total of 6,000 pages. These increases in the amount of work performed were accompanied by reforms such as the implementation of a Plain English Policy and an increased emphasis on the accessibility of the language used.
- 17 In relation to the Information Policy Board and other activities in the communications area, the Committee was informed that benefits that have resulted in the rationalisation of State Government communications. In particular, the operations of Q-TEL which are expected to save the Government some \$10 million a year. Other substantial savings are also being effected in the computing area.
- In relation to the allocation of resources, the Committee inquired as to whether a substantial diversion of resources was required for the role played by the Office of the Cabinet in the establishment of the Australian National Training Authority in Brisbane. The Committee accepts the evidence given that the establishment of the National Training Authority in Brisbane represents a satisfactory outcome from the Government's perspective as a result of the considerable effort expended by the Office of the Cabinet.
- 19 Following questions by Members of the Committee on the operations of the Coordinator General and the reduction in his budget allocation, the Committee was informed that the decrease principally reflected a reduced level of funding to the South Bank Corporation. In addition, the Co-ordinator General had an active involvement in projects such as the sale of the Gladstone Power Station, the Drug Design and Development Centre and the Gladstone land acquisition, all of which were now complete.
- 20 The Premier was also questioned on the operation of the Women's Policy Unit in his Department and the effectiveness of strategies used by it to increase women's representation on statutory authorities. The Committee was informed that the Unit maintained a register of possible appointees and serves as a useful cross-check in the appointment process. In addition, the Unit initiated the Women's Info Link Service which provides information and referral services for Queensland women and provides a link to the Queensland Government.

21 The Committee was interested in possible action on the old airport site at Eagle Farm and urges the Government to continue its negotiations in relation to its planned redevelopment. Such redevelopment, given the strategic nature of the site, while not returning any money to the State Government, will provide further development and opportunities for both the Brisbane City and Airports.

## Estimates for the Treasury Department

- One of the first matters considered by the Committee in the Treasury portfolio was a matter of terminology. This derived from the actual make-up of "estimated actuals". The Committee was informed that this was a new term which was being applied because the budget had been brought down during the financial year to which the previous financial year accounts referred. While in the past it had been possible to supply the Parliament with actual figures, the situation had now arisen where only ten months of actual figures were available. The estimated actuals were based on that ten months actual expenditure extended to the full twelve month period by the estimate for the remaining two months of the financial year.
- 23 The Committee sought details of improvements in efficiencies in Ministerial offices as indicated in Budget Paper No. 3. In response, it was found that a survey had been carried out as part of the administration of the Ministerial offices by the Treasury Department, that Branch being responsible for ensuring a consistent application of guidelines across all Ministerial offices. This uniform approach assists in the efficient and effective administration of the offices. The Committee was also informed that as part of the program management there is a requirement that all sub-programs and programs be evaluated or reviewed once every three years.
- 24 The Committee also sought information on the justification for the Government Superannuation Office's involvement in a joint venture with the Queensland Investment Corporation. That venture consisted of providing post-retirement investment products and services to public sector employees. The Committee was assured that it is not unique for governments to provide post-retirement schemes for their employees and that involvement in this scheme did not entail using the strength of Government to compete against the private sector in an improper manner. Q-Invest, which will operate the scheme, will be a public corporation subject to corporations' law and to the Commonwealth Government's Superannuation Industry Superannuation Legislation.
- 25 The Committee also questioned the use of the Queensland Corporate Card. Use of the Card varies between departments and it is supplied on a needs basis. The Committee received evidence that it was not automatically available to employees in senior executive positions and that training had been provided for purchasing officers and monitoring was undertaken by both the Treasury Department and the Auditor General. It is anticipated that some 2,000 Cards will be issued by the end of the current financial year and that savings of \$2.5 million will accrue annually.

- With the impending corporatisation of certain elements of the Queensland public sector, the Committee queried the reduction in budget for the GOE unit of the Department. The reduction from the previous year came about because of substantial office relocation costs in 1993/94 which masked an actual increase in staff numbers. The Committee was also told that the GOE unit would be assisting in setting performance agreements and overall monitoring of the new corporations. This included all parts of the process including drawing up the statements of corporate intent and monitoring the financial performance and efficiency performance of the entities.
- 27 The Committee also sought information in relation to the principles which will apply in relation to the operation of the Queensland Infrastructure Financing Fund. That Fund has been established to assist projects which are or should be commercial but are outside the investment horizon of the private sector. The Committee sought and was assured that only those projects that the Government believed would eventually be commercial and have a great economic benefit to the State of Queensland would be entertained.
- 28 The Committee also raised the matter of whether funds coming from the Casino Licence Fees in both Cairns and Brisbane would be dedicated exclusively to the construction of the Convention Centres in those cities. The Committee was assured that this would be the case.

# Estimates for the Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

- 29 The Committee queried the necessity for a substantial increase from \$37 million to \$51 million in the budget allocation for Housing - Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders. It was explained that it had been necessary to increase the program by that level in response to Mabo land claims. More specifically, there had been an amount of money that had been carried over into the current financial year due to the inability of the Government to spend that money in Aboriginal communities because of the prospect of Mabo-type claims over Aboriginal housing. These issues had to be addressed before those funds were able to be spent. The Committee was also informed that it was, in fact, Commonwealth grant funds and that the Commonwealth Government had agreed to it being carried over to the next financial year.
- 30 In relation to HOME Scheme loans, the Committee sought details of the amount of money which would be available and the manner in which it would be borrowed. Evidence was provided that funds would be sought on an as required basis.

- 31 In relation to private rental Community Rent Schemes the Committee also sought information as to why a reduction had occurred in the budget estimate at a time when there was an increasing number of people looking for Community Rent Scheme housing. The Committee accepts that it is an excellent scheme and understands that some of the costs in the current financial year had been related to implementation and that there would be no degradation of the level of assistance offered.
- 32 Housing for people with disabilities is also provided through the Department and was the subject of questioning by the Committee. It was told that the Department worked closely with people who apply to it for rental accommodation and who have disabilities, with the aim of providing homes suited to their needs. The numbers of people assisted in this manner have increased dramatically over more recent years and, if necessary, can include construction of a purpose-built house.
- 33 The Department's planning program has seen a significant increase over the previous year. It was explained to the Committee that this came about from funding for the Far North Queensland 2010 project, funding of the SEQ 2001 Regional Resource Unit within the Department and the on-going operations of the work in relation to SEQ 2001. Some other elements involved in the increase were due to changing staffing patterns and operational requirements.
- 34 Questions were asked as to whether independent revues of the HOME Scheme were needed to ensure its continued viability. The Committee was informed that one independent review had recently been completed which had found that the performance of the HOME Scheme was similar to organisations such as the Metway Bank and the Suncorp Building Society. The Committee was also assured that the operation of the scheme did not pose any problem to the State's financial position.
- 35 Further questioning from Committee Members in relation to this matter sought to determine why the initial review contained some criticisms. The Committee was told that, while the Report may have contained some criticisms, overall it found the Scheme was operating well. In addition, the Committee was told that certain changes had been made in the operation of the Scheme and that it would continue to be monitored.

## The Estimates Committee Procedure

36 This Committee makes comments in its Report No. 1 in relation to areas which could be the subject of review to refine the Estimates Committee process.

## Conclusion

- 37 The Committee appreciates the co-operation afforded to it by all Ministers and their departmental officers. The Committee congratulates these officials on their preparedness and willingness to properly fulfil their accountability responsibilities.
- 38 The Committee has agreed to the proposed expenditures referred to it, without amendment.

## Recommendation

39 The Committee recommends that the proposed expenditure be agreed to.

16 bater

Mr Tom Barton MLA Chairman

## STATEMENT OF RESERVATIONS BY MINORITY



## **Estimates Committee A - Reservation Statement**

#### Premier, Economic and Trade Development

- 1. In querying the increase in the Premier's Department Budget, we are not of the view that there has been any major structural change in the Department since 1989, as argued before the Committee by the Honourable the Premier.
- 2. Close analysis of the Departmental structure indicates that the only significant restructuring has been the removal of part of the Parliamentary and Government services section to form the new Legislative Services Unit. On this basis, today's Cabinet Office is simply 1989's Policy Co-ordination Unit with the Office of the Co-ordinator General taking over the resources previously provided to the Economic Development Unit. The minority is therefore of the view that comparison between 1989 and 1994/95 is possible and relevant.
- 3. It is noted that in evidence the Honourable the Premier stated that he was confident that measures he had implemented in respect of program evaluation had "genuinely delivered real benefits and real improvements in terms of performance and efficiency". It is also noted that at page 4 of the Departmental Estimates Statement (Parl and Govt Services) the Department comments that "more attention is required in relation to the development of performance indicators and the measurement of performance".
- 4. The minority also notes the Honourable the Premier's acknowledgment that a "clerical error" was the reason Budget papers indicated a Cabinet office staffing of 76 while an internal telephone directory lists staff numbers at 91.

- 5. The minority notes, for the record, that there has been a 179 per cent increase in spending on public sector management since 1989. These figures are calculated by the minority from information provided in the 1990/91 and 1994/95 Budgets. In particular, page 73 of the 1990/91 Budget Paper Number 3 shows the Public Sector Management Budget to be \$2,456 million and page 54 of the 1994/95 Budget Paper Number 3 shows the PSMC Budget to now be \$6,874 million.
- 6. In view of this massive increase in spending, the minority expresses its reservation at the performance of the PSMC and its role in public sector reform, in particular in its reforms of the Health Department, the Education Department and the Department of Primary Industries.
- 7. The minority also notes that staff numbers in the Senior Executive Service have now reached 547, an increase of 17 per cent over 1993/94 and 91 per cent over 1991.
- 8. The minority also expresses concern at the cost of the Premier's suite at the Gold Coast Indy event which the Honourable the Premier has advised totalled \$107 583 for four days.
- 9. In relation to the Department of Premier and Economic Development it is also noted that the cost of consultancies for 1993/94 is expected to be \$9.3 million, an increase of 24 per cent on 1992/93.

#### **Treasury Department**

- 10. The Committee sought information regarding the use of ministerial office staff in Ministers' electorate offices. The Committee was informed that it is common practice, since the election of the Goss Labor Government, for some Ministers to staff their electorate offices from Ministerial staff entitlements. The Committee was advised that this policy does not extend to the Coalition Leaders, despite the similarity of work load and circumstances regarding electorate availability.
- 11. The Committee also sought details of efficiency improvements in Ministerial offices. When questioned about efficiency improvements in Ministerial offices the Treasurer failed to provide what the minority believe to be satisfactory evidence of enhanced performance of those offices. The Treasurer was unable to advise of any financial savings or service enhancements as a result of the supposed efficiencies but referred instead only to intangible service enhancements.

- 12. The Committee requested details regarding the budget allocation of each of the Ministerial offices. The Treasurer declined to provide this information to the Committee on the basis that it did not fall within his responsibilities. The minority noted, however, that when the Premier was questioned regarding his Ministerial office budget he advised that this line of questioning should correctly be directed to the Treasurer. The Premier noted "the expenditure for these matters.... falls within the Treasury Department". The minority notes the conflict of opinion and is still awaiting clarification as to who has responsibility for Ministerial office budget allocation.
- 13. Members of the Committee requested an explanation from the Minister as to why some local governments were experiencing unacceptably long delays in obtaining loan approvals from the State Government with some reported delays of up to five months. The Minister was unable to explain the cause of these, but provided the Committee with an assurance that the matter would be investigated and resolved.
- 14. The non-government members of the Committee requested information from the Minister regarding the Indy Car Race as this topic had already been raised by Government members of the Committee in earlier questions. The Committee was prevented from pursuing this request by a ruling from the Chairman to the effect that it fell outside of the Committee's terms of reference. This issue was put to a vote and the Chairman's ruling was upheld on party lines. The non-government members believe this to be at least a breach of the spirit of the committee procedure and the scope of the committee should be broadened to allow more complete investigation of the activities of the department.

#### Housing, Local Government and Planning

- 15. The minority believes that there needs be an independent assessment of the H.O.M.E. scheme before the end of 1994-95. In this respect the Standard and Poors report on H.O.M.E., completed for the Government in January this year, indicated it was so small it was not capable of threatening the State's AAA credit rating. The scheme nevertheless has seen an investment of in excess of \$1.5 billion in borrowed funds, with Standard and Poors making several disturbing findings in relation to management.
- 16. These included a number of criticisms in relation to the management of loans, both in terms of initial criteria, and on-going management. These criticisms were of particular concern to the minority because the potential for problems in this area of H.O.M.E. administration were established in 1990 via the precedent of the HomeFund scheme on which it was modelled.

- 17. Similarly, the critique by Standard and Poors of the cash flow model used under the H.O.M.E. scheme, similar to that used by HomeFund, provided little comfort in relationship to the standards being applied to the management of H.O.M.E. in the light of the dangers in the product illustrated by the fate of HomeFund. In estimates before the committee the Minister indicated some remedial action has been taken in the loans area in response to the Standard and Poors report, and that other action in that area is currently the subject of discussion with Treasury, as is the design of a replacement cash flow model.
- 18. Given the preparedness of the Minister in the past to maintain that the loans section was in fact not open to the same sorts of problems as emerged in the New South Wales scheme, and because the amounts of money involved in the scheme are very significant, a minority of the Committee believe an independent assessment is appropriate to ensure proper follow-up action is taken.
- 19. The minority also express concern that the Minister has failed to satisfactorily provide full details of HLO-4 (Community Service Housing), in particular, the location of such housing, the average cost of such housing and the areas most in need.

Jon Sedan. Delaley Autor Antin

Rob Borbidge, MLA

Joan Sheldon, MLA

Di McCauley, MLA

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

## Minutes of Meeting held 30 May 1994

#### ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

#### Minutes of the Meeting held on 30 May 1994 at 2.00 p.m. in Room A.35 Parliament House, Brisbane

1.	Present:	Mr T Barton MLA		
		Mr R Borbidge MLA		
		Mr J Budd MLA		
		Mr K Davies MLA		
		Mrs D McCauley MLA		
		Mr W Nunn MLA		
		Mrs J Sheldon MLA		
	In Attendance:	Mr D Martin, Research Director		
		Mr R Mensforth, Senior Research Officer		

#### 2. Appointment of Committee

The Research Director referred to the Sessional Orders of 28 April 1994 appointing Estimates Committees and announced that, pursuant to a resolution of the House of 28 April, the above listed Members were appointed Members of Estimates Committee A.

#### 3. Election of Chairman

By leave of the Committee, the Research Director proceeded to the election of the Chairman.

Mr Barton was nominated by Mr Davies and seconded by Mr Nunn.

And there being no further nominations, Mr Barton was declared elected and took the Chair.

#### 4. Election of Deputy Chairman

Before proceeding to the election of the Deputy Chairman, the Chairman, by leave, made a short statement indicating that the position was available to an Opposition Member of the Committee if so desired. Mr Borbidge, by leave, also made a short statement indicating that because of a possible perception of conflict of roles no Member of the Opposition would contest the position.

The Chairman then proceeded to the election of the Deputy Chairman.

Mr Budd was nominated by Mr Davies and seconded by Mr Nunn.

And there being no further nominations, Mr Budd was declared elected.

#### 5. General Business

The Chairman circulated a list of possible time allocations for Departments for consideration by Members of the Committee.

After discussion, it was <u>agreed</u> that the Chairman and Mr Borbidge, after consultation with other Members, would determine an appropriate timetable, and that such timetable would be presented to the Committee at its next meeting.

#### 6. Time and Date of Next Meeting

The Committee <u>agreed</u> that it would next meet at Parliament House on 7 June 1994 at 4.00 p.m. in Room B.29.

#### 7. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 2.25 p.m.

Confirmed this seventh day of June 1994

abatan

CHAIRMAN

## Minutes of Meeting held 7 June 1994

#### ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

#### Minutes of the Meeting held on Tuesday 7 June 1994 at 4.00 p.m. in Room B 29 Parliament House, Brisbane

Ι.	Present:	Mr T Barton MLA Mr R Borbidge MLA		
		Mr J Budd MLA Mr K Davies MLA		
		Mrs D McCauley MLA		
		Mr W Nunn MLA		
		Mrs J Sheldon MLA		
	In Attendance:	Mr D Martin, Research Director		
		Mr R Mensforth, Senior Research Officer		

#### 2. Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting

On the motion of Mr Budd, seconded by Mrs Sheldon, the Minutes of the Meeting held on 30 May 1994 were confirmed.

#### 3. Correspondence

On the motion of Mrs Sheldon, seconded by Mr Nunn, inwards correspondence was received and outwards correspondence confirmed.

#### 4. Arrangements for Public Hearing

The Committee discussed arrangements for the public hearing to be held on 9 June 1994.

It was agreed that the time allocation for Departments be as set out hereunder:

Speaker	1 hour
Governor	10 minutes
Ombudsman	20 minutes
Auditor-General	1 hour
Premier's Department	3 hours
Treasury	3 hours
Housing, Local Government	
and Planning	3 hours

The Committee also agreed, after discussion, that:

- (i) It would be appropriate for Government and non-Government Members to sit as two separate groups;
- (ii) Answers to questions taken on notice be required to be forwarded to the Committee by 5.00 p.m. on Friday, 10 June, unless otherwise ordered;
- (iii) No "at Table" briefings by Members' staffs take place;
- (iv) No breaks be taken for afternoon tea or supper;
- (v) In accordance with Sessional Orders, leave be given to non-Committee Members to ask questions during the hearing, and
- (vi) In accordance with paragraph 9 of the Procedures to be Observed by Assembly Committees regarding Witnesses, any deliberation on Chairman's rulings be conducted in private.

#### 5. Time and Date of Next Meeting

The Committee <u>agreed</u> that it would next meet at Parliament House on Friday, 10 June 1994, at 11.30 a.m. in Room A.35.

#### 6. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 4.54 p.m.

Confirmed this tenth day of June 1994

Blacton

CHAIRMAN

## Minutes of Proceedings held 9 June 1994

#### ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

#### Minutes of Hearings of Estimates Committee A held at 11.30 a.m. on 9 June 1994 in the Legislative Council Chamber Parliament House, Brisbane

#### 1. MEETING

The Committee met in public session at 11.30 a.m. The Chairman, Mr Tom Barton, took the Chair.

#### 2. STATEMENT BY THE CHAIRMAN

The Chairman made an introductory statement concerning the Committee's consideration of proposed expenditure contained in the Appropriation Bill 1994 and the Appropriation (Parliament) Bill 1994 for the areas set out in the Sessional Orders.

#### 3. EXAMINATION OF ESTIMATES

#### **Parliamentary Service Commission**

In attendance was the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, the Honourable Jim Fouras MLA, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr R D Doyle	Clerk of the Parliament
Ms M Cornwell	Deputy Clerk of the Parliament
Mr R Fick	Manager, Corporate Services
Mr M Hickey	Acting Manager, Finance

The following Members of the Committee were present:

Mr T Barton MLA Mr R Borbidge MLA Mr J Budd MLA Mr K Davies MLA Mrs D McCauley MLA Mr W Nunn MLA Mrs J Sheldon MLA The Committee examined the witnesses.

Mr C Campbell MLA and Mr A Fitzgerald MLA, by leave, also asked questions.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

#### Office of the Governor

In attendance was the Honourable W K Goss MLA, Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development, accompanied by the following officers:

Lt-Col T Nolan	Official Secretary
Mr E Bigby	Executive Director,
	Government and Corporate Services
Mr E Finger	Director-General
Mr T Leighton	Director, Financial Services

The Committee examined the witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and Lt-Col Nolan withdrew.

#### Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations

Mr F Albietz, Parliamentary Commissioner, and Mr M Schafer, Director, Organisational Services, Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations, attended.

The Committee examined the witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and Mr Albietz and Mr Schafer withdrew.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 12.58 p.m.

Resumption of Sitting

The Committee resumed at 2.00 p.m.

#### Queensland Audit Office

Mr B Rollason, Auditor-General, Ms J England, Assistant Auditor-General, and Mr G Davis, Manager, Financial Services, attended.

The Committee examined the witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and Mr Rollason, Ms England and Mr Davis withdrew.

#### Premier and Minister for Economic and Trade Development

The following officers attended:

Office of the Cabinet

Mr K Rudd	Director-General
Mr R Willims	Deputy Director-General

Government and Corporate Services Division

Mr A Welsh

Director, Administration

Trade and Investment Development Division

Mr L Harris	Executive Director
Mr R Wilson	Senior Policy Advisor,
	Trade and Investment Policy

Public Sector Management Commission

Dr P Coaldrake Mr B Carroll Chair Acting Executive Manager

Office of the Parliamentary Counsel

Mr J Leahy Mr L Bartlem Parliamentary Counsel Administration Manager

Office of the Co-Ordinator General

Mr J Down Mr J Tilston Head Director, Projects Information Policy Board

Mr D Luttrell

Executive Director

South Bank Corporation

Mr B Derrick Mr N Bamford General Manager Manager, Corporate Services

The Committee examined the witnesses.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 4.01 p.m.

Resumption of Sitting

The Committee resumed at 4.12 p.m.

The examination of witnesses continued.

Dr D Watson MLA, by leave, also asked questions.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 5.53 p.m.

**Resumption of Sitting** 

The Committee resumed at 7.00 p.m.

#### **Treasury Department**

In attendance was the Treasurer, the Honourable K E De Lacy MLA, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr H Smerdon Mr G Bradley Mr M Lawrence	Under Treasurer Assistant Under Treasurer (Budget) Assistant Under Treasurer (Corporate Services)
Ms J Macdonnell Mr S Rochester Mr G Waite Mr D Balwin Mr D Hennessy	Executive Director (Office of State Revenue) Chief Executive Officer (Qld Treasury Corporation) Manager, Economic Services Branch Acting Director, Financial Services Branch Executive Director, Gov Superannuation Office
Mr M Sarquis Mr T Bellas	Cabinet Legislation and Liaison Officer Director, Capital Markets Policy Branch

The Committee examined the witnesses.

#### Dissent from ruling moved:

The Chairman ruled that questions relating to the administration and funding of the Indy Car Race do not fall within the area of matters for consideration by Estimates Committee A.

Mr Borbidge moved - That the Chairman's ruling be dissented from -

In private session:

Debate ensued.

Question - That the Chairman's ruling be dissented from -

Ayes

Noes

Mr Borbidge Mrs McCauley Mrs Sheldon Mr Barton Mr Budd Mr Davies Mr Nunn

and so it was negatived.

The Committee continued its examination of witnesses.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

Suspension of Sitting

The sitting was suspended at 10.02 p.m.

Resumption of Sitting

The Committee resumed at 10.15 p.m.

#### Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning

In attendance was the Honourable T Mackenroth MLA, Minister for Housing, Local Government and Planning, accompanied by the following officers:

Mr D Persson

Director General

Housing Services

Mr K Smith	General Manager, Housing Services		
Mr A Ackfun	Manager, Aboriginal and Torres Strait		
	Islander Housing Division		
Ms J Clark	Manager, Home Ownership Division		
Ms L Apelt	Manager, Rental & Community Housing Div		

Housing Production Services

Mr T Waters	General Services	Manager,	Housing	Production
Mr T Cripps		Asset Manag	gement Divi	sion
Planning Services				

Mr K Yearbury	General Manager, Planning Services
Mr W Rowe	Manager, Planning,
	Policy and Information Division

Local Government Services

Mr M Tucker Mr N Hudson	General Manager, Local Government Services Deputy Chairman, Local Government, Grants Commission			
Financial Services				
Mr I Fulton Mr C Callioni	General Manager, Financial Services Division Manager, Financial Policy and Management Division			
Ms J Parker	Manager, Treasury Division			
Organisational Services				
Mr B Hunt Mr T Spark Mr P Edmonds Mr M Douglas	General Manager, Organisational Services Manager, Administrative Support Unit Manager, Information Services Division Manager, Human Resources Division			
Executive Services				
Ms J Phillips Ms K Kirby	Director, Executive Services Manager, Cabinet Legislation and Liaison Unit			
Ms J Jarman	Project Officer, Animal Welfare Bureau			

The Committee examined the witnesses.

Mr J Goss MLA, Mr K R Lingard MLA, Miss F Simpson MLA, and Mr L Springborg MLA, by leave, also asked questions.

The Committee concluded its examination and the witnesses withdrew.

#### 4. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee adjourned at 12.45 a.m., Friday 10 June 1994.

Malaton

CHAIRMAN

## Minutes of Meeting held 10 June 1994

#### ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

#### Minutes of the Meeting held on Friday 10 June 1994 at 11.30 a.m. in Room A.35 Parliament House, Brisbane

1.	Present:	Mr T Barton MLA Mr R Borbidge MLA Mr J Budd MLA Mr W Nunn MLA
	In Attendance:	Mr D Martin, Research Director Mr R Mensforth, Senior Research Officer
	Apologies:	Mr K Davies MLA Mrs D McCauley MLA Mrs J Sheldon MLA

#### 2. Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting

On the motion of Mr Borbidge, seconded by Mr Budd, the Minutes of the Meeting held on Tuesday 7 June 1994 were confirmed.

#### 3. Correspondence

On the motion of Mr Budd, seconded by Mr Nunn, inwards correspondence was received and outwards correspondence confirmed.

#### 4. Discussion of Outcomes of Public Hearing

The Committee discussed the public hearing held on Thursday 9 June 1994 and <u>agreed</u> that the matter be further discussed at its next meeting to be held on Thursday 16 June 1994.

#### 5. Time and Date of Next Meeting

The Committee <u>agreed</u> that it would next meet at Parliament House at 11.30 a.m. in Room A.35 on Thursday 16 June and Friday 17 June 1994.

#### 6. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 11.37 a.m.

Confirmed this sixteenth day of June 1994

Rebater

CHAIRMAN

## Minutes of Meeting held 16 June 1994

#### ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

#### Minutes of the Meeting held on Thursday 16 June 1994 at 11.30 a.m. in Room A.35 Parliament House, Brisbane

1.	Present:	Mr T Barton MLA Mr J Budd MLA Mr W Nunn MLA Mrs D McCauley MLA Mrs J Sheldon MLA
	In Attendance:	Mr D Martin, Research Director Mr R Mensforth, Senior Research Officer
	Apologies:	Mr R Borbidge MLA Mr K Davies MLA

#### 2. Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting

On the motion of Mr Nunn, seconded by Mr Budd, the Minutes of the Meeting held on Friday 10 June 1994 were confirmed.

#### 3. Correspondence

On the motion of Mr Nunn, seconded by Mr Budd, inwards correspondence was received and outwards correspondence confirmed.

#### 4. Authorisation of Publication

On the motion of Mr Budd, seconded by Mr Nunn, it was resolved:

That the Committee authorise the publication of all documents presented to it in the course of its hearings and authorise publication of written replies and other documents forwarded to it.

#### 5. Discussion of Outcomes of Public Hearing

The Committee discussed procedural aspects in relation to the conduct of its public hearing.

#### 6. Chairman's Draft Reports

Copies of the Chairman's Draft Reports in relation to the estimates of expenditure referred to the Committee by the Legislative Assembly were circulated to all Members.

#### 7. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 11.52 a.m.

#### Confirmed this seventeenth day of June 1994

Blaten

CHAIRMAN

## Minutes of Meeting held 17 June 1994

#### ESTIMATES COMMITTEE A

#### Minutes of the Meeting held on Friday 17 June 1994 at 11.30 a.m. in Room A.35 Parliament House, Brisbane

1.	Present:	Mr T Barton MLA Mr J Budd MLA Mr R Borbidge MLA Mr W Nunn MLA Mrs J Sheldon MLA
	In Attendance:	Mr D Martin, Research Director Mr R Mensforth, Senior Research Officer
	Apologies:	Mr K Davies MLA Mrs D McCauley MLA

#### 2. Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting

On the motion of Mr Budd, seconded by Mr Nunn, the Minutes of the Meeting held on Thursday 16 June 1994 were confirmed.

#### 3. Consideration of Chairman's Draft Reports

The Committee proceeded to the consideration of the Chairman's Draft Reports Nos. 1 and 2 in relation to estimates of expenditure referred to the Committee pursuant to Sessional Orders.

On the motion of Mr Nunn, seconded by Mr Budd, it was resolved:

That, in relation to the Legislative Assembly, the Proposed expenditures be agreed to and that the Chairman's Draft Report No. 1, as amended, be adopted as the Report of the Committee and be tabled by the Chairman on 23 June 1994 together with supplementary material. On the motion of Mr Nunn, seconded by Mr Budd, it was resolved:

That, in relation to the Office of the Governor, Queensland Audit Office, Parliamentary Commissioner for Administrative Investigations, Department of the Premier, Economic and Trade Development, Treasury Department and Department of Housing, Local Government and Planning, the proposed expenditures be agreed to and that the Chairman's Draft Report No. 2 be adopted as the Report of the Committee and be tabled by the Chairman on 23 June 1994 together with supplementary material.

Mr Borbidge and Mrs Sheldon indicated on behalf of Opposition Members that a Reservation would be attached to Report No. 2.

#### 4. Adjournment

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 12.35 p.m.

Certified correct this seventeenth day of June 1994

abartan

CHAIRMAN