

PARLIAMENTARY CRIME AND MISCONDUCT COMMITTEE

Annual Report 2003/2004

Report No. 65

THE COMMITTEE

The Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Committee is an allparty committee of the Queensland Legislative Assembly constituted under the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001*.

The principal functions of the Committee are to monitor and review the performance of the Crime and Misconduct Commission (CMC), to report to Parliament on matters pertinent to the CMC (subject to confidentiality constraints), and to participate in the appointment of the Chairman and Commissioners of the CMC.

The Committee has an on-going role in monitoring and reviewing the CMC and also conducts specific inquiries in respect of matters pertaining to the CMC. It is through the Committee that the CMC is accountable to the Parliament and to the people of Oueensland.

COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Mr Geoff Wilson MP

[Chairman] Member for Ferny Grove

Mr Howard Hobbs MP

[Deputy Chairman] Member for Warrego

Mr Michael Choi MP Member for Capalaba
Mr Stuart Copeland MP Member for Cunningham
Mrs Liz Cunningham MP Member for Gladstone
Mr John English MP Member for Redlands
Ms Cate Molloy MP Member for Noosa

STAFF

Research Director Mr Stephen Finnimore
Principal Research Officer Ms Ali de Jersey
Executive Assistant Ms Andrea Musch

CONTACTING THE PCMC

Address: Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Committee

Parliament House George Street Brisbane Qld 4000

E-mail: pcmc@parliament.qld.gov.au

Telephone: 07 3406 7207 **Facsimile:** 07 3210 6011

Copies of this report and other PCMC publications are available on the Internet via the Queensland Parliament's home page at:

www.parliament.qld.gov.au/Committees/

INTRODUCTION

The Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Committee (PCMC) is established under s. 291 of the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001* as the Parliamentary Committee having oversight of the Crime and Misconduct Commission. The PCMC is the successor to the Parliamentary Criminal Justice Committee (PCJC) which was established in 1990.

This reporting period covers the final stages of the three year term of the fifth PCMC and the beginning of the term of the sixth PCMC. Unlike other Committees of the Queensland Parliament, the PCMC continues in existence despite any dissolution of the Parliament. Thus, notwithstanding the dissolution of the Legislative Assembly on 13 January 2004 the fifth PCMC continued until the appointment of the sixth PCMC by the Legislative Assembly on 18 March 2004.

In November 2003, the Committee tabled a report on some of the more significant activities of the fifth PCMC, and reference to that report should be made for more detail of those activities.²

This reporting year has seen the continued operation of the Crime and Misconduct Commission under the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001* which commenced on 1 January 2002. That Act merged the former Criminal Justice Commission (CJC) and the former Queensland Crime Commission (QCC) into a new body known as the Crime and Misconduct Commission (CMC).

The CJC was established in 1990 in fulfilment of a major recommendation of the Fitzgerald Inquiry into police and public sector corruption. The QCC commenced operation in 1998.

The Committee is assisted in its oversight process by the Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Commissioner, a position originally established in 1998 as the Parliamentary Criminal Justice Commissioner (see below).

As in previous annual reports, the Committee again wishes to acknowledge the cooperation and responsiveness shown by the CMC in its dealings with the Committee.

² Report on Activities, report no 63., 5th PCMC November 2003.

THE COMMITTEE'S RESPONSIBILITIES

Under the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001* the Committee has the following functions:

- to monitor and review the performance of the CMC's functions;
- to report to the Legislative Assembly where appropriate;
- to examine reports of the CMC;
- to participate in the appointment of commissioners;
- to conduct a review of the activities of the CMC at the end of the Committee's term ("the three year review"); and
- to issue guidelines and give directions to the Commission where appropriate.

The PCMC can also receive complaints and deal with other concerns which it may be aware of about the conduct or activities of the CMC or an officer or former officer of the CMC.

MONITORING AND REVIEWING THE CMC

The Committee utilises a range of mechanisms to "monitor and review" the Commission. These mechanisms include:

- holding regular Committee meetings;
- considering confidential bi-monthly reports from the CMC in relation to its activities;
- considering confidential minutes of meetings of the Commission and its Executive;
- holding bi-monthly in camera meetings with the Chairperson, Commissioners, and Assistant Commissioners of the CMC;
- receiving and considering complaints against the CMC and its officers;
- reviewing CMC reports;
- requesting reports from the CMC on matters which arise (via complaints, the media or other means);
- conducting inquiries into specific or general matters relating to the CMC;
- conducting (either itself or through the Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Commissioner) audits of various registers and files kept by the CMC concerning the use of its powers;

¹ Section 301 of the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001*.

- seeking independent legal advice to assist the Committee where a particular skill or expertise is necessary;
- examining the appropriateness of the CMC's performance measures; and
- examining the CMC's performance against its performance measures.

REPORTING TO THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

During the year the Committee considered the tabling of a number of reports by the Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Commissioner on investigations carried out by him at the request of the Committee. The Committee tabled three such reports in the reporting year.

In the other matters reported upon by the Parliamentary Commissioner, the Committee has determined not to table the reports as they generally contained material that was confidential and considered inappropriate for tabling and it was not in the public interest to table the reports (see below).

From time to time, the Committee has, for the information of the Legislative Assembly and the public, tabled publications produced by the CMC.

EXAMINING REPORTS OF THE CMC

Section 69 of the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001* contains a mechanism for CMC reports to be tabled in the Parliament. The Committee is required to direct that the report be given to the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly in order for it to be tabled.

During the reporting year, the Committee gave such a direction in relation to the following reports of the CMC:

- An Investigation of Matters Relating to the Conduct of the Hon. Ken Hayward MP (November 2003);
- The Prosecution of Pauline Hanson and David Ettridge: an inquiry into issues raised in a resolution of Parliament (January 2004); and
- Protecting Children: An inquiry into abuse of children in foster care (January 2004).

In each case, when giving the direction, the Committee did not consider it necessary to make any specific comment in relation to the reports, other than to note that the Committee should not be taken as endorsing or adopting the reports in any way.

PARTICIPATING IN THE APPOINTMENT OF COMMISSIONERS

The CMC is comprised of a Chairperson and four part-time commissioners. In any appointment or reappointment of the Chairperson or a part-time commissioner, the responsible minister, currently the Premier, must consult with the Committee. Any nomination by the Premier requires the bi-partisan support of the Committee before the nominee can be appointed.

The Committee considered and approved the reappointment of one part-time commissioner in the reporting period.

THREE YEARLY REVIEW OF THE ACTIVITIES OF THE CMC

In early 2003, the fifth PCMC commenced the process of its three yearly review of the Commission. A number of submissions were received and public hearings were held over two days in June 2003. Consideration of oral and written submissions continued into the reporting year. The report of the Three Year Review, containing 50 recommendations, was tabled on 15 March 2004.

Issuing guidelines and giving directions to the $\ensuremath{\mathsf{CMC}}$

The Committee did not issue any guidelines or give any directions to the Commission in the reporting year.

COMPLAINTS

Complaints about the CMC or its officers usually come to the Committee in two ways – directly from members of the public or from the Commission itself.

Considering complaints about the Commission and its officers assists the Committee in its oversight role by providing a valuable insight into the Commission's operations and activities. The Committee does not have jurisdiction over any organisation other than the CMC and so cannot itself consider original allegations of official or police misconduct. Further, the Committee is not able to substitute its own decision for that of the CMC in a particular matter.

The Committee examines complaints to assess whether the Commission or any of its officers has acted inappropriately. The Committee will where appropriate make recommendations to the CMC. Analysis of complaints, even where specific allegations against the Commission are not substantiated, can assist the Committee to identify

procedural or systemic deficiencies and to take action to have the Commission deal with problem areas.

Complaints from members of the public

Most complaints come to the Committee directly from members of the public. The PCMC only accepts complaints in writing in order to efficiently identify and consider complaint matters and to prevent misunderstanding or misinterpretation as to the relevant facts or circumstances.

Other complaints about the Commission

Under the Crime and Misconduct Act 2001 the Chairperson of the CMC is obliged to advise the PCMC of conduct by officers of the CMC, where the Chairperson suspects that the conduct may involve "improper conduct".3 Knowledge of such conduct might come to the Chairperson via a complaint made to the Commission about a Commission officer. At present, the Committee receives frank and prompt advice from the CMC Chairperson concerning Commission officers which conduct of suspects may involve Chairperson "improper conduct".

Complaints considered 2003/2004

In the reporting year the Committee received 45 complaints against the Commission or Commission officers, including matters referred by the Commission itself.

In most cases, the Committee determined that the complaints made against specific officers were not substantiated or that it was not satisfied that the Commission had acted inappropriately. In several cases the Committee requested further information from the Commission, asked the Commission to review or amend its practices and procedures, or sought comment on particular aspects of a matter.

In considering complaints the Committee takes into account material and submissions provided by the complainant, any reports and other material provided by the Commission and, if the matter has been referred to the Parliamentary Commissioner by the PCMC, any reports from the Parliamentary Commissioner.

General issues that the Committee considers in determining whether or not the Commission has acted inappropriately include:

• timeliness in the handling of complaints and investigations;

- whether the Commission has made appropriate inquiries before determining not to pursue a matter:
- whether the Commission has considered all relevant facts and material:
- whether investigation methods are appropriate;
- whether the Commission has acted without bias in making its determinations;
- whether the Commission has been responsive and timely in its communications with complainants and with subject officers;
- whether the Commission's conclusions and determinations are justified; and
- whether the Commission has acted within its legislative powers.

MISCONDUCT TRIBUNAL VACANCIES

The Misconduct Tribunals are established to determine disciplinary charges of official misconduct brought against certain prescribed persons – broadly, police officers and public officers.

Under section 7 of the *Misconduct Tribunals Act 1997* the bi-partisan support of the Committee is required before the responsible minister (currently the Premier) can appoint a person (nominated by the minister) to the Misconduct Tribunal. During the reporting year the Committee considered and gave its support to three nominations for appointment.

MECHANISMS AVAILABLE TO THE COMMITTEE

POWERS OF THE COMMITTEE

Under section 293 of the *Crime and Misconduct Act* 2001 the Committee has the power to:

- call for persons, documents or other things;
- administer oaths to witnesses; and
- examine witnesses on oath.

PARLIAMENTARY CRIME AND MISCONDUCT COMMISSIONER

The position of the Parliamentary Criminal Justice Commissioner was altered with the commencement of the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001*. The title of the position was changed and importantly the new legislation made it clear that the Parliamentary Commissioner acts as the agent of the Committee.

³ Section 329 of the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001*.

Mr Robert Needham commenced his appointment as Parliamentary Crime and Misconduct Commissioner on 1 January 2002, on a part-time basis and for a period of two years. In November 2003, Mr Needham's appointment was extended for a further three years, again on a part-time basis.

Role and functions of the Parliamentary Commissioner

Under the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001* the PCMC may require the Parliamentary Commissioner to:

- audit records and operational files of the CMC;
- investigate complaints against the CMC and its officers;
- investigate allegations of a possible unauthorised disclosure of confidential information:
- verify the CMC's reasons for withholding information from the PCMC;
- verify the accuracy and completeness of CMC reports to the PCMC; and
- perform other functions that the Committee considers necessary or desirable.

A major change brought about by the *Crime and Misconduct Act 2001* is that the Parliamentary Commissioner can conduct hearings only with the authorisation of the PCMC.

Assistance provided by the Parliamentary Commissioner in the reporting period

The Committee referred issues involving the CMC's actions in three matters to the Parliamentary Commissioner for investigation during the reporting period. In another matter the Committee requested the Parliamentary Commissioner to oversee an investigation by the CMC into concerns regarding conduct by CMC officers.

In September 2003, the Parliamentary Commissioner reported to the Committee on stage 2 of an audit he had conducted of CMC records for the year to 30 June 2003, pursuant to a prior reference from the Committee.

In November 2003, the Committee provided a further reference to the Parliamentary Commissioner, asking him to conduct an audit of the Commission's records and operational files for the 2003-2004 year.

The Parliamentary Commissioner is provided with a copy of the CMC's bi-monthly briefing paper to the PCMC in order to assist the Committee to identify issues for examination.

PARTICULAR ISSUES CONSIDERED BY THE COMMITTEE

Communication by the CMC

In some complaint matters considered by the Committee in the reporting year, the Committee had occasion to raise with the CMC concerns regarding the adequacy of communication by the CMC with persons who had made complaints to it. The Commission has responded positively to suggestions by the Committee for improving its communication with complainants.

Costs paid by the CMC to a former officer of the Criminal Justice Commission

The Committee considered an *ex gratia* payment of legal costs that had been made by the CMC to a former senior officer of its predecessor, the Criminal Justice Commission (CJC). The claim related to costs incurred in relation to allegations arising from the performance of the officer's duties with the CJC.

The Committee expressed to the CMC its concerns regarding the extent of the costs included in the payment. The Committee also queried the appropriateness of the waiver by the CMC of costs to be paid by the officer to the CJC pursuant to court orders made in related but unsuccessful legal action taken by him against the CJC. The Committee also had concerns regarding the adequacy of the decision making processes at the Commission in this particular matter.

CMC's draft 2004-2008 Strategic Plan

The CMC provided the Committee with a draft of its 2004-2008 Strategic Plan, and the draft plan was considered by the Committee.

Other Matters

The Committee has considered many issues during the reporting period which, for confidentiality reasons, cannot be discussed in this report.

MEETINGS

In addition to Committee meetings (held at least once every sitting week) the Committee holds separate meetings with the Chairperson, Commissioners and senior officers of the CMC on a regular basis, usually every two months.

These meetings are held in camera and provide an opportunity for candid and open discussions. The Committee has found these meetings very valuable for

open communication between the Committee and the CMC

The first meeting with the CMC for the term of the current PCMC was held in public.

To assist with the meeting process the CMC provides bi-monthly briefing papers on its activities since the previous joint meeting. The Committee also considers minutes of internal CMC meetings. The PCMC asks questions in relation to matters contained in these documents or any other matter that has come to its attention.

The Committee also meets regularly with the Parliamentary Commissioner (usually bi-monthly). The Parliamentary Commissioner also provides a report on his activities on a bi-monthly basis. This keeps the Committee informed as to the status of matters that have been referred to the Commissioner as well as administrative issues concerning the office of the Parliamentary Commissioner.

During the reporting year the Committee met 35 times including:

- 5 joint meetings with the CMC; and
- 4 meetings with the Parliamentary Commissioner.

MEETINGS WITH OTHER COMMITTEES

The Committee met in Brisbane with the Western Australian Standing Committee on Legislation in August 2003. Staff of the PCMC met in Brisbane with staff of the Western Australian Joint Standing Committee on the Anti-Corruption Commission in March 2004.

These meetings, whilst held in each case at the request of the WA Committee, assisted the PCMC as they help inform the Committee regarding the operations of relevant bodies in other jurisdictions, and allow the Committee to attain a broader appreciation of the aspects of the Queensland regime that are operating well, as well as areas that could be improved.

It is noted that in significant respects, the new anticorruption scheme in Western Australia has been modelled on the Queensland system.

A delegation of the Committee and one staff member attended the National Conference of Parliamentary Oversight Committees of Anti-Corruption/Crime Bodies in Perth in September 2003.

MINISTERIAL RESPONSES TO COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

MINISTERIAL RESPONSE TO REPORT NO 50 – TELECOMMUNICATIONS INTERCEPTION

The 4th PCJC's report 50, in brief, addressed the desirability of QLD law enforcement agencies (including the then CJC and QCC) being granted the power to use telecommunications interception (phone tapping) and recommended the power be extended to those agencies, subject to strict guidelines.

In previous annual reports this Committee has provided information on interim responses from the Minister for Police to this report.

On 21 June 2002, the Committee wrote to the Premier, referring to the recommendations in report 50 and in the Three Year Review of the previous PCJC (report 55). The Committee urged the government to look favourably on the recommendations of the previous PCJC that the then CJC and QCC (now the CMC) be given the power to use telecommunications interception.

On 17 December 2002, the Premier responded, noting the Committee's views and stating:

I am aware that there may be implications on the Crime and Misconduct Commission's ability to access telecommunications interception flowing from the establishment of the Australian Crime Commission. I can advise you that this and other issues relevant to these changes are under consideration.

MINISTERIAL RESPONSE TO REPORT NO 64-THREE YEAR REVIEW OF THE CMC BY THE $\mathbf{5}^{\text{TH}}$

The Premier, as the Minister responsible for the CMC, wrote to the Committee in April 2004 referring to legislation introduced into the Legislative Assembly which dealt with some matters which were the subject of recommendations by the 5th PCMC in its report on its Three Year Review of the CMC (the Three Year Review report).

An interim response to the Three Year Review report was tabled by the Premier on 15 June 2004. In his interim response, the Premier advised that a full response would be provided by 15 September 2004. The full response was tabled on 10 September 2004.

BUDGET AND EXPENDITURE

The total budget allocation for the Committee in 2003/2004 was \$285,299.00.⁴ The Committee's total actual expenditure for 2003/2004 was \$269,615.67.⁵

The expenses for the Committee are set out in the following table.

Salary costs ^a	182,805.15
Employee allowances and recruitment expenses	2219.56
Employ taxes/accruals ^b	58,321.26
Business travel ^c	13,415.93
Printing	4,995.93
Telephone costs	2,514.97
Books, subscriptions, memberships & publications	1844.36
Maintenance of equipment	178.08
Hospitality	2,201.32
Freight, consumables and depreciation	441.99
Members' travel	677.12
TOTAL	269,615.67

- a) Includes temporary assistance, higher duties and overtime.
- b) Includes Superannuation, FBT, payroll tax and Workcover premiums.
- Includes travel and other expenses relating to attendance at meetings, hearings and staff travel with, or for the Committee.
- d) Members' travel to or from committee meetings outside of session.

_

This is an adjusted figure to take into account an earlier error in the budget allocation. The adjusted figure compares with the Committee's budget allocation for 2002/2003 of \$304,230.00.

This compares with the Committee's actual expenditure for 2002/2003 of \$213,755.07. The difference is largely attributable to extra salary-related costs for an extra research officer engaged to assist the Committee at the time of the Three Year Review of the CMC.

DATE	PURPOSE	Geoff Wilson	Howard Hobbs	Desley Boyle	Stuart Copeland	Bill Flynn ⁶	Andrew McNamara	Kerry Shine
21 July 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X
5 August 2003	PCMC / WA SLC	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓
20 August 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
21 August 2003	PCMC / Parliamentary Commissioner	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
22 August 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓
22 August 2003	PCMC / CMC	✓	✓	✓	X	√	✓	✓
10 September 2003	PCMC	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
24 September 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	X
8 October 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
10 October 2003	PCMC / CMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓
15 October 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
16 October 2003	PCMC / Parliamentary Commissioner	X	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓
29 October 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
5 November 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	✓	✓
12 November 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	✓	X
13 November 2003	PCMC / Parliamentary Commissioner	~	√	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
20 November 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	X
26 November 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	√	✓
16 December 2003	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X
16 December 2003	PCMC / CMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	X	✓	X
13 January 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	√	X	X
19 February 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	X	✓	_	✓	X

2003/2004 Meeting Attendance Record: 6 th PCMC								
DATE	PURPOSE	Geoff Wilson	Howard Hobbs	Michael Choi	Stuart Copeland	Liz Cunningham	John English	Cate Molloy
19 March 2004	PCMC Induction	✓	✓	✓	✓	√	✓	✓
21 April 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
28 April 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
30 April 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
30 April 2004	PCMC / CMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	······································	✓	*
12 May 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	√	✓	✓	✓	✓
19 May 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
20 May 2004	PCMC / Parliamentary Commissioner	✓	✓	√	✓	√	✓	~
16 June 2004	PCMC	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
18 June 2004	PCMC / CMC	✓	X	√	✓	✓	✓	✓

X

⁶ Mr Bill Flynn, former member for Lockyer, served as a member of the committee until 18 February 2004.

PCMC

3 March 2004